





# YOUNG WOMEN'S LEADERSHIP PROJECT BOUGAINVILLE WOMEN'S FEDERATION – IWDA

# END OF PROJECT EVALUATION

JANE COUSINS APRIL 2019

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A big thank you goes to the evaluation team in Bougainville, without whom this evaluation would not have been possible. Field work team members Melvine Giobun and Jonitha Lesi overcame numerous logistical challenges to ensure the evaluation went ahead as planned, provided critical translation and insights, were tireless and always engaged. Margarette Kiroha provided much appreciated administrative support and Judith Oliver provided valuable perceptions of the project over time.

The consultant also wishes to thank the young women leaders and members of Bougainville Women's Federation's Executive Committee and Secretariat for their commitment to the evaluation process and participation in the Evaluation Planning and Data Analysis Workshops. They offered important perspectives on how the work begun by the Young Women's Leadership Project might be strengthened, supported and sustained into the future.

Thanks also go to the Department for Community Development and the Australian Government's Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, who also provided valuable perspectives, particularly in relation to sustainability.

Finally, a very big thank you to the young women participants themselves and the community leaders and Bougainville Women's Federation members in the communities consulted during the evaluation, who made time to meet with the evaluation team and shared their stories and experiences so openly.

Jane Cousins, Consultant

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

LIST OF ACRONYMS EXECUTIVE SUMMARY INTRODUCTION METHODOLOGY FINDINGS RECOMMENDATIONS 1 1. INTRODUCTION 1.1 PROJECT CONTEXT 1.2 EVALUATION RATIONALE AND PURPOSE 1
INTRODUCTION METHODOLOGY FINDINGS RECOMMENDATIONS
1.1 PROJECT CONTEXT
2. METHODOLOGY12.1 EVALUATION APPROACH12.2 DATA COLLECTION TOOLS12.3 SELECTION OF COMMUNITIES12.4 DATA COLLECTION12.5 DATA ANALYSIS12.6 LIMITATIONS12.7 ORGANISATION OF FINDINGS1
3. FINDINGS       1         3.1 RELEVANCE       1         3.2 EFFECTIVENESS       2         3.3 EFFICIENCY       4         3.4 SUSTAINABILITY       4
CONCLUSION4
ANNEXES

# LIST OF ACRONYMS

ABG	Autonomous Bougainville Government
ACFID	Australian Council for International Development
AGM	Annual General Meeting
ANU	Australian National University
APEC	Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation
APWLD	Asia Pacific Forum on Women, Law and Development
ARB	Autonomous Region of Bougainville
BWF	Bougainville Women's Federation
BYI	Bougainville Youth Initiative
CG	Community Government
CSO	Civil Society Organisation
DCD	Department for Community Development
DFAT	Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
DWF	District Women's Federation
DYA	District Youth Association
DYWA	District Young Women's Association
FFT	Family Farm Teams (Training)
FGD	Focus Group Discussion
IWDA	International Women's Development Agency
KII	Key Informant Interview
MEL	Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning
MELF	Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning Framework
MTR	Mid Term Review
NGO	Non-Government Organisation
SRH	Sexual and Reproductive Health (Training)
TOR	Terms of Reference
TOT	Training of Trainers
UN	United Nations
WAVE	Women's Action for Voice and Empowerment
WEE	Women's Economic Empowerment
YWA	Young Women's Association
YWLP	Young Women's Leadership Project

# **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

### INTRODUCTION

The Young Women's Leadership Project is a 36 month, \$1.4 million project implemented by Bougainville Women's Federation in partnership with International Women's Development Agency as part of the Pacific Women Shaping Pacific Development program with funding from the Australian Government in partnership with the Government of Papua New Guinea. It addresses the needs and ambitions of young women aged 18-30 years seeking to increase their leadership effectiveness and provide a safe space in which young women can engage and support each other, and participate in decision making for Bougainville Women's Federation. It builds on research outlining barriers to young women's leadership and participation in Bougainville<sup>1</sup> and a pilot Young Women's Leadership Project designed in response to the research findings.

The goals of the project are:

- 1. Young women will have stronger leadership skills and confidence, and a greater voice in local and regional government affairs and policy development.
- 2. The Bougainville Women's Federation is strengthened as a sustainable, inclusive representative body for women across Bougainville.

The project targets 120 women across four target districts, delivering trainings on leadership skills, human rights, sexual and reproductive health and financial management. Following the pilot which worked with 30 young women in North Bougainville in 2015, Young Women's Leadership Project employs young women alumnae of the pilot as trainers. The project also creates safe spaces for young women to organise and be represented within the Bougainville Women's Federation structure.

### METHODOLOGY

The Evaluation assesses the project's achievements in relation to relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability, using the project design and monitoring, evaluation and learning framework, and the Baseline established by the Australian National University/Bougainville Women's Federation research. The evaluation used a participatory and mixed methods approach to capture change in a range of ways. Qualitative methods such as focus group discussions enabled the views of participants to be heard and helped 'unpack' data from project monitoring and progress reports and added confidence about causality. They also provided good material for learning and improving the design of future projects. Before and after the data collection participatory workshops were held with young women leaders, Bougainville Women's Federation staff and Secretariat and Executive Committee Members to finalise evaluation questions and analyse data.

Young Women's Leadership Project has a strong focus on capacity building for sustainability and this principle was incorporated into the evaluation itself. In line with evaluation objectives to engage young women participants in a critical reflection on project outcomes, young women were involved at every stage of the evaluation – the planning, development and finalisation of evaluation questions; development of data collection tools; collection of data in the field; and participation in data analysis workshop and development of recommendations. In addition, mature Bougainville Women's Federation members had an opportunity to participate in both the planning and data analysis workshops. This has contributed to enhanced understanding of the key enablers and challenges of the Project and engaged the Federation and young women in joint planning on how to sustain the momentum built by the project and move forward together to fuller achievement of project goals. Coming at a time when donor funding for Young Women's Leadership Project has come to an end in this cycle, this engagement and ownership will be a crucial enabler in sustaining project outcomes.

#### **FINDINGS**

#### EFFECTIVENESS

<u>OBJECTIVE 1</u>: Young women will have stronger leadership skills and confidence, and a greater voice in local and regional government affairs and policy development.

Young women leaders in four target districts are identified, trained and mentored. Young women across the four Young Women's Leadership Project target districts and North Bougainville have increased

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> <u>Young Women's Leadership Study</u>, commissioned by BWF and IWDA, 2014.

confidence and leadership skills as a result of their participation in leadership, gender equality and human rights, sexual and reproductive health, and financial literacy trainings. Change had taken place across a number of dimensions – in knowledge and attitude (outputs), and behaviour and practice (outcomes). Many young women spoke of changes in attitude, thinking and character leading to changes in how they see themselves as well as in how others view them. Young women are more confident and identify as leaders in their own communities. A core group of "outstanding and outspoken young women" (Bougainville Women's Federation Secretariat Member, KII, Buka, 21/2/19) see themselves as leaders, able to speak out on behalf of and organise other young women.

# A cohort of young women are putting their skills into practice in communities and Bougainville Women's Federation.

Achievements: A cohort of young women trainers has been established and young women are sharing skills and information with their peers in the areas of gender equality and human rights, leadership and financial literacy. Young women are also taking up community and political leadership positions, for example, 36 young women took up such roles in 2018, and some are taking the lead and organising within their Ward. This has created a 'virtuous circle' in which young women's participation in the development of their communities, leading positive change, has demonstrated their potential for leadership and is being recognised and supported by community members. Young Women's Leadership Project alumnae have also been successful in gaining employment. The confidence, budgeting skills, and understanding of good leadership and gender equality and experience organising and facilitating workshops have made Project alumnae competitive candidates for employment with Non-Government Organisations. Young women are also taking on leadership roles within Bougainville Women's Federation, for example, four young women have taken on leadership roles within their respective District Women's Federations. This demonstrates both an achievement for individual young women who have the confidence and skills to represent their members and an important shift in the culture of Bougainville Women's Federation. Young women trainers are using financial literacy skills to support young women's livelihoods projects and economic empowerment, and Young Women's Associations networks, such as those in Kieta and North Bougainville, have mobilised groups of young women into small cooperatives and provided loans or start-up money. This has expanded the membership base of Young Women's Associations and resulted in positive impacts for some of the most marginalised young women in Bougainville, including single young mothers and young women with a disability. Finally, young women have also applied their planning and facilitation skills to organising the Young Women's Leadership Forums in 2017 and 2018, activities for 16 Days of Activism, and International Women's Day.

Lessons learned: The key lesson learned here was that young women based in rural settings have poorer outcomes than their urban counterparts in terms of putting leadership skills into practice. Young women in urban areas had the support of each other (informally and through their Young Women's Associations affiliated to the District Women's Federations); the ability to mobilise more easily as a group in order to undertake projects, awareness raising or fundraising activities; better access to services such as banks and a central market; and more reliable communication and transport. They were also better able to seek advice and mentoring from mature District Women's Federation members (who tended to be based in the district centre), to liaise and collaborate more easily with a variety of non-government organisations and government bodies, and to take advantage of the opportunities this afforded for additional training. In contrast, young women based in rural areas, who made up the majority of young women participating in Young Women's Leadership Project, were dispersed across the district and isolated from each other, had virtually no access to District Women's Federation mentors, and faced barriers of poor communication and transport. Rural communities are more traditional, so rural young women were less likely to have support from parents and partners, more likely to be faced with resistance to the idea of young women playing non-traditional leadership roles, more likely to have a lower level of education and more likely to have lower confidence and self-esteem. To summarise, young women participants in rural areas needed the most support and follow up after completion of training, but received the least. This finding is amplified by the fact that overall the more successful Project participants were those young women involved in successive Bougainville Women's Federation projects.

The gap between urban and rural outcomes was exacerbated by the highly transparent selection processes employed by the project. While this allowed young women from all areas in the target districts the chance to participate, including those who lived in remote areas, some community leaders felt it had resulted in too wide a range of confidence and ability in terms of previous leadership experience, level of education and status within their community, which impacted negatively on young women leaders' ability to put skills into practice after training. Compounding this was limited awareness of project aims at both district and community level, and limited effective consultation and collaboration with Community and District Governments, with negative impact on the enabling environment. In addition, District Women's Federation members were unclear about Young Women's Leadership Project and their role in it, resulting in poor networking and collaboration between District Women's Federations and Young Women's Associations, which also limited support to young women leaders, particularly in rural areas. Lack of funding for start-up capital to establish small businesses, conduct training, undertake community outreach and awareness activities was also identified as a barrier for rural alumnae, who did not have access to a Young Women's Association through which to conduct fundraising for start-up loans.

An enabling environment for women's leadership at the community level is strengthened through awareness raising at the district level and working with male advocates. Two strategies were designed to address barriers to young women's participation in leadership. Male partners of young women leaders were enlisted and trained as supporters of their spouses and advocates of the program in the wider community, and mature women leaders were sought to mentor and support young women leaders.

Achievements: Male champions were recruited and those who were active provided strong support, making noticeable contributions in patrilineal areas such as Buin. Young and mature women within Bougainville Women's Federation were reported to be working more effectively together by the end of the project, with a small cohort of active and dedicated mature Federation mentors providing considerable support. An unexpected outcome was the significant contribution made by financial literacy and business development training to creating an enabling environment, as bringing income into the family increased respect and appreciation for young women's ability and gave legitimacy to other activities outside the home, including leadership roles.

**Lessons learned**: Young women leaders reported that there is still considerable resistance from families, male partners and others in the community, as well as from many mature women in Bougainville Women's Federation. Not all male partners'/family members were trained and those who were received little follow-up support. Young Women's Leadership Project managers acknowledged that the strategy has been more effective in mitigating the risk of male partner retaliation than contributing to social norm change in the wider community. A key issue with mature women mentors was the lack of a systematic approach to mentoring, exacerbated by the fact that few District Women's Federation members saw the Young Women's Leadership Project and the mentoring of young women leaders as part of their role.

Young women's networking skills are strengthened and networks established at local and regional level. Young Women's Associations were established in the four target districts (Wakunai, Kieta, Buin and Torokina) and in five Community Government areas in North Bougainville. Three out four Young Women's Associations included in the evaluation are still functioning (Wakunai Young Women's Association's Executive Committee had reportedly disbanded and the status of the other four in North Bougainville is unknown). A key aim of the Young Women's Associations was to develop a support network for young women's leadership across Bougainville.

Achievements: The Young Women's Associations were found to be an effective structure through which to roll out trainings and awareness on gender equality and life skills in target districts, and (for young women participants who had access to them, i.e. those in proximity to urban centres) an effective mechanism for mobilising members for fundraising and income generation. Working in and as a group enabled young women leaders to develop a shared vision and work towards achieving it together. While the focus of collective action to date has been helping group members and other young women in their communities establish small business ventures, rather than working together on advocacy campaigns, the experience of collective action has clearly strengthened their networking skills at local level.

**Lessons learned**: The evaluation indicates that Young Women's Associations are vulnerable to operational and sustainability challenges. Unreliable communication networks and transport, along with a lack of funding are barriers to Young Women's Associations' networking with their members in rural areas. Without adequate support and/or leadership, Young Women's Associations are vulnerable to disbanding, and to limiting their focus to income generation for their members. Additionally, poor communication and networking between Young Women's Associations and District Women's Federations is limiting the potential of the Associations to elevate young women's representation within the Bougainville Women's Federation structure by 'transitioning' young women, with the aid of District Women's Federation mentoring, from membership of Young Women's Associations to membership of District Women's Federations.

Safe Spaces are established for young women within Bougainville Women's Federation structures. The Young Women's Leadership Forums, the first of their kind in Bougainville, were designed to create a space for young women to share experiences, learn from one another, build networks and solidarity across Bougainville and beyond, and advocate for change. In addition, in response to the limited participation of young women in decision making in Bougainville Women's Federation, as identified by the baseline research, the Young Women's Caucus was established in 2017 and in 2018 a Young Women's Representative was appointed to the Executive Committee of Bougainville Women's Federation.

**Achievements:** Two Young Women's Forums have taken place and feedback from both young women leaders and mature Bougainville Women's Federation members indicates their success in showcasing young women leaders' skills and leadership abilities towards positively influencing attitudes of mature women leaders. The Forums have also allowed young women to develop sustainability plans beyond the end of the project and develop ideas for advocacy campaigns.

**Lessons learned:** Indicators for outcomes related to these activities include the number of women participating in the Young Women's Leadership Forum, the number of young women members participating in the youth caucus and the *number of motions the youth caucus is able to get passed through Bougainville Women's Federation structures.* Since the young women's representative position on the Bougainville Women's Federation Executive Committee is very new and no data was available on the number of motions the youth caucus was able to get passed, it is assumed none have been yet, beyond the creation of that position. Currently Young Women's Caucus meetings take place after trainings and do not require dedicated funding. If future trainings are funded by Young Women's Associations themselves and are more localised in nature, both the impetus and resources for Caucus meetings may diminish.

# <u>OBJECTIVE 2</u>: Bougainville Women's Federation is strengthened as a sustainable, inclusive representative body for women across Bougainville

# There is increased awareness of Bougainville Women's Federation and the importance of women's leadership across Bougainville, with particular focus on the districts.

Achievements: Due to the Project's success, communities and other stakeholders have seen young women take up leadership roles and start small businesses after receiving leadership and financial literacy/business skills training. Through the positive contribution young women have subsequently made to their families and communities, Young Women's Leadership Project has heightened awareness of the importance of women's leadership – in particular young women's leadership – across Bougainville.

**Lessons learned:** There was feedback from some quarters that Bougainville Women's Federation (as opposed to Young Women's Leadership Project) was not effective in reaching out to communities, in engaging with and reporting to the women whose interests it claims to represent.

# Bougainville Women's Federation is a more inclusive and representative body for women across Bougainville.

#### Organisational structure

**Achievements:** Young Women's Associations have been established in each district, providing a safe space for networking and peer support at district level. They also catalysed the livelihood initiatives which contributed funding towards further training opportunities for young women. In addition to the Young Women's Associations, Bougainville Women's Federation established the young women leaders Caucus, an umbrella group for the Associations, that provides young women leaders with a platform for consolidating and prioritising their collective interests and representing them to the Federation at national level through the newly created young women's representative position on the Federation Executive Committee.

**Lessons learned:** Through the course of this evaluation, it may be questioned whether one young woman leader in the Bougainville Women's Federation Executive Committee is enough. Many young and mature women and stakeholders already see the need to improve on this. They argue that while young women can now represent their own interests within Bougainville Women's Federation, this could remain tokenistic if not matched by a meaningful level of participation in decision making at national level, reflecting the fact that 60% of the population are 'youth'. This issue is made more pressing by two observations: one, that the existence of the Young Women's Forum, which remains the key space in which young women's interests are raised and advocacy conducted, may be in doubt after funding through Young Women's Leadership Project ceases, like that of the young women's Caucus; two, as noted by external stakeholders, that Bougainville Women's Federation is not adequately fulfilling its core mandate of working with key political figures and influencing government policy and practice in the interests of Bougainville women.

#### **Organisational culture**

**Achievements:** There is strong evidence of a shift in the culture of the Bougainville Women's Federation towards greater acceptance of younger women. A growing number of mature women leaders, many of whom have held leadership roles with Bougainville Women's Federation for a long time, are supporting young women's leadership potential and recognising their contributions to their communities and to the organisation. Young women are increasingly included in a range of Federation activities and acceding to representational and salaried roles. Many have been recruited to positions with the Federation at national level, with young women now comprising a majority of the Bougainville Women's Federation Secretariat.

**Lessons learned:** While it was widely acknowledged by both young and mature women in Bougainville Women's Federation that the gap between them is decreasing and the culture of the organisation is changing, both groups reported they still see room for improvement when it comes to attitudes. The persistence of negative attitudes from some mature Federation members has contributed to young women leaders' frustration with the pace of change toward a more equitable sharing of power. While young women value Bougainville Women's Federation and their membership in it, some would like to operate within a separate division of the organisation, running their own projects with their own budget. While this suggestion may not be adopted by Bougainville Women's Federation, it reflects a potent desire by some very capable young women leaders to take responsibility for ensuring the needs of young women are addressed, based on long term planning and access to secure funding.

#### Organisational strengthening

Activities under the second output for Objective 2 aimed to strengthen Bougainville Women's Federation capacity to facilitate scale-up of Young Women's Leadership Project and ensure successful delivery of project activities. These activities were designed to strengthen aspects of the organisation's governance and management capacity.

Achievements: The evaluation team was not aware of any baseline data on the organisational and project management capacity of Bougainville Women's Federation prior to the commencement of Project implementation, however, at the output level, to the extent that Young Women's Leadership Project was scaled up and delivered successfully to the four target districts and North Bougainville, it can be concluded that organisational strengthening was achieved.

Lessons learned: These are dealt with under Efficiency.

#### EFFICIENCY

# Bougainville Women's Federation's management of Young Women's Leadership Project and of project monitoring, evaluation and learning.

Achievements: Although project management was a relatively new area for Bougainville Women's Federation and was perhaps especially challenging given the organisation was managing multiple projects during the period of Young Women's Leadership Project implementation, it succeeded in delivering project activities in all target areas. Further, although Bougainville Women's Federation management of Young Women's Leadership Project was rated 'poor' by one high level external stakeholder and 'fair' by another, the Project's value and success was readily and heartily acknowledged. Nevertheless, it should be remembered that in the absence of strong engagement in the Project by the majority of District Women's Federation leaders, it was the Young Women's Associations that were the primary delivery mechanism for many project activities, including trainings and other events such as the young women's Caucus meetings and Young Women's Forums. In this sense, implementation of project staff, rather than with the support of Bougainville Women's Federation, the membership organisation.

**Lessons learned:** Areas the evaluation identified for improvement in the Federation's management of the project included enhanced direction, mentoring and oversight of project staff by the Federation Secretariat; improved staff accountability mechanisms; improved communication with stakeholders about the project, its successes and learnings; strengthened financial management; and development of a functional and user friendly monitoring, evaluation and learning system. Project staff reported that despite their best efforts to bring on board early the District Department for Community Development officers, the latter did little to collaborate with the District Women's Federations or to "perform their mandated role to assist women and women's groups in the districts" (Community Leader, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19), resulting in ineffective utilisation of young women leaders in organisations that would have benefited from their skills and lack of funding for Young Women's Associations from Department for Community Development at district level.

### SUSTAINABILITY

Sustainability of project outcomes beyond the project's lifetime was assessed at community and institutional level, in terms of whether young women leaders have the capacity and resources to continue their leadership at community level, and whether Young Women's Associations and other structures created, such as the Youth Caucus, have adequate support and capacity to continue functioning beyond Young Women's Leadership Project.

**Achievements:** With 20 young women leaders trained as trainers in key Young Women's Leadership Project topics, and the ability to raise funds through income generating projects, some young women leaders see financial literacy training and business development as the foundation for future sustainability at the community level. Further, young women leaders have developed a reputation for sound financial management and good governance which positions them strongly for integration into the government's youth association network, providing Young Women's Associations with the opportunity to access funding for the provision of training for a wide variety of youth associations at many levels.

Likewise, the strengthening of the Federation's organisational capacity through access to skilled trainers and resources (e.g. tailored *Gud Disisons, Gud Lidasip* manual), expanded relationships with training organisations, and structures through which to attract and organise young women members and deliver trainings (i.e. Young Women's Associations), has increased the relevance and viability of Bougainville Women's Federation along with its continued ability to build the capacity of young women leaders.

**Lessons learned:** In terms of improving the lives of young women through local level interventions, this strategy is highly effective and efficient, and appears likely to be sustainable beyond the life of the project. The challenge will be coordinating efforts of individual Young Women's Associations and leveraging their fundraising efforts to support higher level networking and advocacy activities. This will require the support of an organisational structure, like that of Bougainville Women's Federation, which is functional and effective at all levels. This evaluation indicates that Bougainville Women's Federation would benefit from additional support to ensure they have appropriate functionality and effectiveness.

Bougainville Women's Federation was positioned strongly by Young Women's Leadership Project to continue young women's leadership programming through non-financial means (i.e. without dedicated external funding), for example through increased advocacy at national level and by mobilising support for Young Women's Associations at district level through District Women's Federations and District Department for Community Developments. However, the requirement to first address the issues of poor coordination of District Women's Federations and their problematic relationship with Young Women's Associations (see above) in order to carry out such mobilisation, means the organisation currently lacks capacity to follow through on this.

### RECOMMENDATIONS

#### Increase deployment of skilled young women in leadership roles.

- 1. To ensure utilisation of young women's leadership skills and address challenges they face taking up leadership roles, consider the following strategies/models:
  - 1.1 **Support individual young women leaders in their communities.** To create an enabling environment for young women to take up leadership roles, undertake to strengthen links between young women and their communities (from village to Ward level) by:
    - 1.1.1. Developing a Young Women's Leadership Project orientation package for use at community and Ward level to ensure chiefs and leaders in the communities from which Young Women's Leadership Project participants are drawn understand Project objectives and approach;
    - 1.1.2. Mapping out stakeholders and potential partners at village and Ward level and linking young women participants with mentors and potential leadership roles from the beginning of their participation in the project;
    - 1.1.3. Giving young women a voice at community level by instituting formal representation from young women in community structures such as weekly community meetings;
    - 1.1.4. Involving chiefs and community leaders in the leadership and gender trainings, and providing orientation and training to community level mentors as well as Young Women's Leadership mentees;

- 1.1.5. Strengthening networking between Young Women's Leadership Project participants in rural areas and their district Young Women's Associations, for example, by funding attendance at Young Women's Association meetings or outreach activities involving young women leaders from different communities and coordinated by their district Young Women's Association;
- 1.1.6. Monitoring the activities of young women leaders in their communities after training.
- 1.2 **Support groups of young women leaders at Ward level**. Establish a mechanism for formal collaboration between Wards and Bougainville Women's Federation with the aim of creating and mobilising groups of young women at Ward level. Delivery of training and support locally would be more cost effective and young women would gain confidence and support from mobilising as a group. This option would not exclude the recruitment of individual young women into Ward, Community Government or community group leadership roles, but may include:
  - 1.2.1 Developing a Young Women's Leadership Project orientation package for use at Community Government level to ensure stakeholders understand Young Women's Leadership Project, its objectives and approach;
  - 1.2.2 Developing a process for selection of young women participants at Community Government level in consultation with relevant Community Government stakeholders (this could be facilitated by Bougainville Women's Federation constituency members) and setting up young women's groups at Community Government level;
  - 1.2.3 Delivering training to groups of young women at Community Government (not district) level;
  - 1.2.4 Integrating young women's groups into Community Government structures by involving them in activities that the Community Government steering committee may plan in the community and/or invite the group to plan a project in consultation with steering committee and aligned with community needs. Assign roles and responsibilities, provide supervision and mentoring on project management, and monitor performance;
  - 1.2.5 Facilitate exchange visits between Community Government young women's groups and/or organise a forum at District level to enable networking, mutual learning and exchange;
  - 1.2.6 If funding permitted, recruit a Development Officer at District level to coordinate delivery of training, conduct support visits, assist Young Women's Associations to organise District level Young Women Leaders' Forum, etc.
- 2. To address the issue of low confidence and self-esteem as a barrier to Young Women's Leadership Project graduates taking up leadership roles, consider the following:
  - 2.1 Reviewing Young Women's Leadership Project trainings to incorporate best practice in building confidence and **self-esteem** in the Pacific region, e.g. by adapting from the Young Women's Christian Association's *Rise Up* Program;
  - 2.2 Identifying less confident young women leaders early and provide dedicated follow up and mentoring support;
  - 2.3 Providing young women with incentives to initiate and/or actively participate in post-training activities, such as conducting awareness training on gender issues with their peers, for example by providing in-kind contributions such as stationery and umbrellas.

# To strengthen Bougainville Women's Federation capacity to sustain delivery of young women's leadership programming.

- 3. To develop Young Women's Associations and strengthen Bougainville Women's Federation's capacity to deliver young women's leadership programming, undertake the following:
  - 3.1 Register Ward level young women's associations with Young Women's Associations (and thereby Bougainville Women's Federation);
  - 3.2 Ensure Young Women's Associations are recognised by and positioned to collaborate with district and local government departments at all levels. This includes affiliation/registration of Young Women's Associations with District Youth Associations and access to Bougainville Youth Initiative funding;
  - 3.3 Continue to profile the activities and achievements of young women leaders at district and community level.
- 4. To strengthen Bougainville Women's Federation's capacity to deliver young women's leadership programming,
  - 4.1. Revitalise and strengthen the District Women's Federation structure, including:

- 4.1.1 Re-establish the non-functioning District Women's Federations;
- 4.1.2 Include at least one Young Women's Associations representative in the District Women's Federation Executive Committee. This would ensure young women leaders are mentored and able to represent the concerns of young women at district level, and would assist with transition of young women leaders into the District Women's Federation when they turn 30 years of age (the cut-off age for members of Young Women's Associations);
- 4.1.3 Review District Women's Federation Executive Committee Terms of Reference, to ensure they specify responsibility to communicate and collaborate with Young Women's Associations and more broadly with constituents, e.g. at Constituency and Ward levels;
- 4.1.4 Ensure all new District Women's Federation members receive an orientation on Bougainville Women's Federation's structure, vision, mission and objectives, membership and program activities, including sustainability strategies such as fundraising;
- 4.1.5 Review and improve as necessary, or establish two-way reporting and accountability mechanisms in Bougainville Women's Federation, between national and district levels.
- 4.2 Promote Bougainville Women's Federation and young women's leadership at grassroots level through joint campaigns conducted by District Women's Federations and Young Women's Associations. This would also encourage collaboration between District Women's Federations and Young Women's Associations (mature and younger women) and help to breach the current separation while advertising the benefits of membership and attracting young women members.
- 5. Ensure that project staff (and/or project staff of implementing partner organisations) are equipped with adequate project management and monitoring and evaluation skills by:
  - Ensuring transparent and merit based recruitment of project staff;
  - Ensuring implementing partner and Secretariat and Executive Committee members understand project objectives and strategies in full, and all new members are fully briefed;
  - Conducting a training needs assessment and providing training in project management and monitoring, evaluation and learning;
  - Conducting an Inception workshop to ensure understanding and ownership by all stakeholders of 'big picture' project objectives and details of how all staff/roles contribute to achieving the whole;
  - Establishing a project Monitoring Information System, including tools and processes for collecting and analysing project data, in alignment with the project Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning Framework;
  - Establishing accountability and performance appraisal mechanisms which guarantee effective oversight of project management and monitoring, evaluation and learning activities, e.g. by requiring reporting to the Executive Committee.
  - 5.1 Ensure adequate budget for monitoring and evaluation activities;
  - 5.2 Address issues of poor financial management;
  - 5.3 Require Executive Committees of Young Women's Associations to provide quarterly reports to District Women's Federation Executive Committees; require District Women's Federations to provide quarterly reports to Bougainville Women's Federation; and require the Federation to provide summaries of District activities to the membership through its regular communication/s, e.g. newsletter.
  - 5.4 Conduct annual assessments of Young Women's Association activities to improve learnings for young women's programming.

# To strengthen the enabling environment for young women's leadership in the community through engaging male advocates.

- 6. At a minimum, the Project should continue to engage men in project activities, to minimise the risk of harm to young women as a result of project activities ('Do No Harm'). For specialised or high-capacity implementers of young women's leadership projects, engaging men to promote gender equitable social norms should be considered (advocacy).
  - 6.1. **'Do no harm'/support strategy:** At the least, to ensure Young Women's Leadership Project participants are not exposed to the risk of retaliation from male partners or family members who feel threatened or intimidated by young women's new skills and opportunities outside the home, develop a Young Women's Leadership Project male supporter training package and provide training to the male partners, brothers, fathers etc. of each young woman participant. In particular, address male

concerns that women are 'wasting' time on activities (whether trainings, meetings, leadership roles, etc.) outside the home for which there is no financial return. Consider incorporating income generation activities as one strategy to counter this and include male relatives of participants in the training. In line with best practice in gender training, ensure men and women are trained together, as this provides an opportunity for sharing different gender perspectives and promoting mutual understanding and a shared vision. Monitor male supporters' attitudes (via their partners) and activities (if they go beyond adopting a supportive role), and provide positive feedback and recognition;

6.2. Advocacy strategy: For organisations with sufficient capacity this option could be considered if an opportunity arises to take male support of young women leaders to the next level. This would involve training male supporters to advocate for social norm change in the broader community, in partnership for example with the Nazareth Centre for Rehabilitation. In addition to basic male supporter training, male advocates would be trained in conducting activities in the community to promote more gender equitable attitudes. Advocates would develop action plans, receive support to implement these, and their activities would be monitored to capture achievements and learning for identifying best practice for improvement. They would be provided positive feedback and recognition.

#### 6.3. For both 'support' and 'advocacy' strategies:

- 6.3.1 If district level Young Women's Forums were to take place, male supporters and/or male advocates could participate, share their experience, network and use the opportunity to review their own advocacy activity plans in light of learning from others. This would also present an opportunity for the joint development of advocacy campaigns at a Ward, constituency or district level;
- 6.3.2 If Young Women's Associations become formally affiliated with District Youth Associations, explore options for recruiting male District Youth Associations members as advocates for young women leaders;
- 6.3.3 Engage male Ward Members and other male community leaders to speak out at community level on the aims of Young Women's Leadership Project and the benefits of young women leaders activities for the whole community. Offer gender and human rights training.

# To strengthen an enabling environment for young women's leadership in Bougainville Women's Federation.

- 7. A number of suggestions are made for improving support to young women leaders within and by the organisation:
  - 7.1 Develop Young Women's Leadership Project mentors and mentees training packages including terms of reference, orientation, training and support. Mentors might be mature Bougainville Women's Federation women and other women leaders in the community, as well young women leaders who are able and willing to mentor their peers; mentees would be young women participants in Young Women's Leadership Project. The involvement of both mentors and mentees will ensure shared expectations of the mentoring relationship;
  - 7.2 **Provide financial and in-kind support to mentors.** Explore options for providing allowances to cover the cost of travel and accommodation for mentors travelling to rural areas or young women travelling in, plus incentives (e.g. in the form of trainings, workshops, conferences);
  - 7.3 **Provide positive feedback and recognition to mentors** and opportunities to share and learn from each other. This could take place at District Women's Federation meetings, or more formally in Congress meetings or at Young Women's Forums (if these continue to take place), either at district or national level. Consider profiling young women leaders and their mentors in Young Women's Leadership Project promotional material, to promote the benefits and rewards of mentoring and being mentored. Monitor mentoring provided (disaggregated by mentors and mentees, age, and Bougainville Women's Federation/non-Federation members);
  - 7.4 Provide young women leaders opportunities for exposure and participation in high level discussions, negotiations and advocacy, increase the involvement of young women in mature women's program activities beyond participation in trainings (e.g. Women's Action for Voice and Empowerment trainings), annual general meetings and Congresses. For example, include young women leaders in high level meetings with stakeholders;
  - 7.5 Ensure adequate inclusion and representation of women who are the most vulnerable and marginalised. Bougainville Women's Federation is recommended to develop policies (e.g. a Gender Equality and Social Inclusion policy) and plans to promote inclusion and representation of the interests

of women who are most vulnerable and marginalised, including young women, single mothers, women living with a disability, poor women and women living in remote areas.

- 8. Explore ways to improve communication and collaboration at district level between Young Women's Associations and District Women's Federations, and between national Bougainville Women's Federation level and district and community levels, including, for example:
  - 8.1 **Review accountability mechanisms for reporting outcomes of national level advocacy** to the membership. Review current mechanisms for linking with government structures at all levels and explore ways to improve communication and collaboration, particularly at Ward level. Ultimately, a representative organisation is only as strong as its members, the strength of whose support for Bougainville Women's Federation women leaders (from local to national level) will rest on their understanding of how Bougainville Women's Federation leaders and Bougainville Women's Federation as an organisation represents and furthers their interests.
- 9. With a view to **developing a succession plan for** Bougainville Women's Federation, begin a discussion between mature and younger women of the pros, cons and conditions under which more equal representation of young and mature women might take place.
- 10. In view of the ongoing annual funding that Bougainville Women's Federation is likely to receive in future through statutory provisions of the Autonomous Bougainville Government (i.e. the Bill before parliament at the time of writing) table the issue of split budget/separate funding for young women leaders for discussion in the Executive Committee. If approved, this might be in the form of project funding for specific purposes, such as outreach campaigns (in conjunction with District Women's Federations); operational costs for delivery of Young Women's Leadership Project training; or kick-start funds for small business development.
- 11. In order to provide ongoing support for Young Women's Leadership programming through Bougainville Women's Federation at district level, explore ways to improve communication and collaboration at district level between Young Women's Associations and District Women's Federations, and between national Bougainville Women's Federation level and district and community levels (as recommended above).
- 12. Provide funding to Bougainville Women's Federation to cover the operational costs of the Young Women's Forums and Caucus meetings (and other key activities?) in order to support the structural and cultural transformation of the organisation and the deeper integration of young women into meaningful decision making roles.
- 13. Integrate Young Women's Associations with the government structure by registering them with District Youth Associations. Young women's groups at Ward level could also become registered by first affiliating them with Young Women's Associations.

# **1. INTRODUCTION**

### **1.1 PROJECT CONTEXT**

The Young Women's Leadership Project (YWLP) was a 36 month, AU\$1.4 million project implemented by Bougainville Women's Federation (BWF), in partnership with International Women's Development Agency (IWDA), as part of the Pacific Women Shaping Pacific Development program with funding from the Australian Government in partnership with the Government of Papua New Guinea.

YWLP aimed to address the needs and ambitions of young women seeking to increase their leadership effectiveness and provide a safe space in which young women can engage and support each other, and participate in decision making for BWF. It built on research outlining barriers to young women's leadership and participation in Bougainville<sup>2</sup> and a pilot young women leaders project designed in response to the research findings.

The goals of the project were:

- 1. Young women will have stronger leadership skills and confidence, and a greater voice in local and regional government affairs and policy development.
- 2. The BWF is strengthened as a sustainable, inclusive representative body for women across Bougainville.

The project targeted 120 women across four target districts, delivering trainings on leadership skills, human rights, sexual and reproductive health (SRH) and financial management. Following the pilot which worked with 30 young women in North Bougainville in 2015, YWLP employed young women alumnae of the pilot as trainers. The project also created safe spaces for young women to organise and be represented within the BWF structure.

### **1.2 EVALUATION RATIONALE AND PURPOSE**

This end of project evaluation serves as an assessment of the impact and changes brought by the project and assessment of the quality of its approaches. It also provides lessons learned on what works and why, to inform future IWDA women's leadership programming and to support BWF's planning on sustaining its support for young women's leadership into the future. In this sense, it is an assessment of past practice, but also has a strong focus on program sustainability, and offers recommended improvements into the future.

The objectives for this final evaluation are:

- 1. Understand key successes, and explore the extent to which project objectives have been met.
- 2. Highlight implementation barriers and enabling factors to inform future programming.
- 3. Engage young women participants in a critical reflection on project outcomes, (intended and unintended, positive and negative).
- 4. Further build capacity of BWF in participatory evaluation techniques.

# 2. METHODOLOGY

### 2.1 EVALUATION APPROACH

The Evaluation assesses the project's achievements in relation to the evaluation questions below, relating to relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability, using the project design and Monitoring, Evaluation and Learning Framework (MELF), and the Baseline established by the Australian National University (ANU)/BWF research. The evaluation used a participatory and mixed methods approach to capture change in a range of ways, exploring not only what change occurred, but why and how. Qualitative methods such as focus group discussions (FGD) enabled the views of participants to be heard and helped 'unpack' data from project monitoring and progress reports and added confidence about causality. They also provided good material for learning and improving the design of future projects. Before and after the data collection participatory workshops were held with young women leaders, BWF staff and Secretariat and Executive Committee Members to finalise evaluation questions and analyse data.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> <u>Young Women's Leadership Study</u>, commissioned by BWF and IWDA, 2014.

# EVALUATION QUESTIONS AND SCOPE

The evaluation approach is structured in relation to the following evaluation questions, grouped into the four dimensions of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability.

#### Relevance

 How relevant is YWLP to the needs of young women seeking to increase their leadership effectiveness and to the needs of partners and stakeholders, including communities, the Autonomous Bougainville Government (ABG) government and donors?

#### Effectiveness

- To what extent has YWLP achieved its objectives and outcome areas?
- To what extent have project strategies increased young women's leadership through stronger agency and access to leadership opportunities?
  - To what extent have young women's leadership skills and confidence increased as a result of YWLP? To what extent have the most marginalised young women been reached (including those living with a disability, in remote rural areas and/or single mothers at a young age)?
  - How are young women participating in BWF? At district level? At national level? Does this differ from before the project? Has their participation increased? If so, how?
  - What factors support young women's participation in BWF? (e.g. mentoring of young women leaders by mature BWF members, support by the wider community for young women leaders, support by male advocates, women's economic empowerment).
  - What factors still prevent or limit young women's participation in BWF? (household responsibilities, gender dynamics, age dynamics).
  - To what extent do young women have a greater voice in local government affairs?
  - What factors support young women's participation in community groups and local government?
  - To what extent do young women have a greater voice in regional government and policy development?
  - What verifiable impact or significant change (positive or negative) has the project brought about for young women? Are these changes attributable to YWLP, and what is the evidence for this?
  - Do project participants see BWF as being a more inclusive and representative organisation for young women, including marginalised young women, i.e. those in remote rural areas, those living with a disability and those who are mothers at a young age?
  - What verifiable impact or significant change (positive or negative) has the project brought about for BWF at national and district level? Are these changes attributable to YWLP, and what is the evidence for this?

### Efficiency

- How efficient is the management of YWLP? Analyse the performance of the Monitoring and Evaluation mechanism of the project and the various tools (database, trackers etc.).
- What is the value of YWLP and BWF's management of YWLP to partners and to beneficiaries?

#### Sustainability

- Are the outcomes likely to be sustainable and enduring? To what extent are the project results likely to be sustainable beyond the project's lifetime (both at the community and institutional level).
- How could sustainability have been strengthened?

# 2.2 DATA COLLECTION TOOLS

Qualitative participatory tools were developed in collaboration with the YWLP Evaluation Team and IWDA (Annex 4). These included FGD guides for young women leaders, community leaders, male advocates, and young men and women who did not participate in the program. Different sets of key informant interview (KII) questions were tailored for government departments and Department of Foreign Affairs (DFAT), BWF Executive Members, BWF Secretariat and District Women's Federation (DWF) Presidents.

### 2.3 SELECTION OF COMMUNITIES

Communities visited in the evaluation were selected from the four target districts: one community from each district. In addition, since alumnae and Young Women's Associations (YWAs) had been active during the project period, two additional communities were included from one district in North Bougainville.

### 2.4 DATA COLLECTION

A desk review of key YWLP documents and materials included project design documents, work plans, progress reports, promotional and advocacy material associated with the project (such as the video "Be the Change" and case studies of successful young women participants), and a benchmark research study jointly undertaken by the ANU and BWF in 2015 to inform design of the YWLP pilot phase.

Data at the end-point of the project was assessed against the ANU/BWF research data, which was treated as the baseline for the current YWLP project (2016-2018). Comparisons were made with reference to the leadership capacities of young women; the level and efficacy of their participation in local and regional government affairs and policy development; and the sustainability, inclusiveness and representativeness of BWF as the peak body representing women in Bougainville. Data from project documents was analysed with reference to the projects two objectives, as well as the 'what' of outcomes achieved and the 'why' of factors that enabled it or prevented it from happening. Findings from this desk review informed the evaluation team's qualitative research plan by identifying gaps in data, gaps in understanding of how and why project activities were or were not successful, and issues for further exploration, such as the role of young women's economic empowerment as an enabling/success factor.

Qualitative data was collected during the field trip through FGDs with community leaders and FGDs and other participatory activities such the Spider Web, which were conducted with groups of young women participants in the five target areas. One FGD was also held with young males who had not participated in the project. Key informant interviews were conducted with YWLP staff, BWF Executive and Secretariat members, government representatives, and other stakeholders (see Annex 4). The findings of this data was cross-referenced and triangulated with the data provided by project monitoring and annual reports.

### ALIGNMENT WITH ETHICAL RESEARCH STANDARDS

The evaluation adhered to the Australian Council for International Development's (ACFID) *Principles and Guidelines for Ethical Research and Evaluation in Development* (updated July 2017). Prior to participating in research activities all participants were fully informed of the purpose and nature of the research and had a chance to ask questions. They were informed of their right to privacy and confidentiality and the option to withdraw their involvement at any time (see consent forms in Annex 5). There was one occurrence of a key informant seeing her words had been noted down incorrectly when these appeared as a quotation in the data analysis workshop. The person involved requested a change to the quotation and this was done.

### USE OF IWDA'S FEMINIST RESEARCH FRAMEWORK

IWDA's feminist research framework provides guidance for ethical management of evaluation research, with reference to the ACFID Guidelines (2017, p. 3). According to these, while the evaluation research undertaken for the end-line assessment of YWLP required careful oversight and planning it did not require an ethical review<sup>3</sup>. Ethical considerations were managed by the Program Manager, referring to the IWDA Feminist Research Framework.

One key application of IWDA's Feminist Research Framework was the evaluation's use of feminist participatory research methods, which sought to disrupt normative power dynamics of 'researcher' and 'researched' by involving young women leaders and BWF Executive and Secretariat members both in planning the evaluation and analysing the data and developing findings and recommendations. In line with evaluation Objective 3, to engage young women participants in a critical reflection on project outcomes, young women were involved at every stage of the evaluation – the planning, development and finalisation of evaluation questions; development of data collection tools; collection of data in the field; and participation in data analysis workshop and development of recommendations. Evaluation Objective 4, to further build capacity of BWF in participatory evaluation techniques, was met to some degree by giving mature BWF

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> This was because data was routinely collected, did not address sensitive topics or involve vulnerable groups, and did not use large amounts of participant time. The evaluation activity did not pose any risk for participants beyond those routinely experienced in the environment where the research was conducted, could not be linked to individuals, and the data collected and analysed was only used to identify areas for project improvement.

women the opportunity to participate in both the planning and data analysis workshops.

The Feminist Framework also provided guidelines for assessing and mitigating risks posed to young women by the conduct of the evaluation.

### 2.5 DATA ANALYSIS

After the qualitative data was collected the consultant undertook a preliminary analysis, synthesising all of the data sets. Initial findings, challenges, lessons learned and provisional recommendations for enhancing project performance and outcomes were presented to BWF young women leaders, current and former YWLP project staff, members of the Secretariat, and elected office holders in BWF, including Executive Committee members, in an analysis and reflection workshop. The team actively discussed the findings and responded to the provisional recommendations and added their own recommendations for improving the design, management, implementation, addressing challenges and ensuring sustainability going forward, for both BWF going forward and for other Young Women's Leadership programs. The outcomes of the workshop have been integrated into this report.

### 2.6 LIMITATIONS

### SELECTION OF COMMUNITIES

Due to transport, communication, logistical and cost challenges it was impossible for the evaluation team to meet with young women and community leaders outside of urban areas, although the majority of YWLP participants live in rural settings. This reduced the number of people involved in FGDs and KIIs and meant the evaluation team was unable to validate a finding relating to young rural women participants (see below). The team met with young women project participants, BWF members and other stakeholders in the district centres of three of the four target districts and in the vicinity of Buka in North Bougainville. As only a minority of YWLP participants; it cannot be assumed that the situation for young women in the more rural areas is the same as that of young women in and close to urban centres.

### ACCESS TO SELECTED COMMUNITIES

The evaluation team planned to visit Torokina District, located on the remote west coast of Bougainville and accessible only by boat. Due to bad weather and advisories against travel by sea, the team was unable to make the trip. This also impacted the representativeness of the data collected, as Torokina is unique among the project sites targeted due to its remoteness, lack of access to services, and the related vulnerability of its young women. Lack of access to this community represents a gap in the evaluation data.

### COMMUNICATION AND LOGISTICS

Damage to the Digicel mobile phone tower in Arawa, Kieta District, left the evaluation team without internet access for three days, requiring meetings to be arranged through face to face contact and word of mouth. As a result, the number of participants in each focus group in Arawa, Buin and Wakunai were small, possibly skewing the data collected in favour of more active young women leaders (those more easily contactable and centrally located). These challenges also prevented the team from meeting with the General Managers of District Administrations. Absence of the government perspective on young women leaders and YWLP at district level constitutes a significant gap in the data.

### PROJECT MONITORING DATA

Quantitative monitoring data for YWLP is almost entirely lacking aside from records of all participants in trainings and other events. Even these records have not been collated and consolidated into usable data. As a result, quantitative data collected via participatory self-evaluation as part of this evaluation (Figure 1) relies on recollections of skills levels before training, which inherently contains perception bias. The qualitative data is also less than robust, based on only a small number of individual success stories. Overall, the data inadequately monitors the type, extent or reason for changes, either those that were expected at or those that were unexpected, positive or negative. Recommendations under Objective 2 include suggestions for improving the project's collection and use of data.

### **EVALUATION QUESTIONS**

Some YWLP outcome areas were overlooked in the development of the evaluation questions and data collection tools. One of these was the extent to which young women's 'networking skills' were strengthened by the project.

### 2.7 ORGANISATION OF FINDINGS

Findings are presented in Section 3 under four broad headings of Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency and Sustainability. The narrative under each of these four headings is further divided into *Achievements*, *Enabling Factors*, *Challenges/Lessons Learned* and *Recommendations*.

# **3. FINDINGS**

### **3.1 RELEVANCE**

**Program design.** YWLP is a "leadership for development" program, which means it seeks to build the capacity of a civil society organisation (CSO) that represents women's interests – the BWF – as well as that of individual young women. It recognises the importance of the 'political' nature of leadership and seeks to train young women in networking and advocacy and how to work politically in a positive way both within their own 'safe space' and with mature women leaders in BWF (given the importance attached to facilitating the use of networks in YWLP, this aspect of the program is seen as most vulnerable in terms of sustainability). This approach is based on evidence from meta research across a wide variety of contexts (Pacific Women Support Unit, March 2017, p. 5).

The YWLP strategies were also based on understanding of and adapted to the local context, developed in response to key challenges identified in young women's leadership and BWF sustainability by the *Young Women's Leadership Study* carried out in 2014 by a joint ANU/BWF research team. Project activities were designed to address these issues and achieve the two project objectives using a three-pronged approach: building the skills of individual young women; providing support to an organisation in which young women could be nurtured as future leaders, practice their political and leadership skills and build solidarity with other women; and working to change gender norms and practices that held young women back.

The project's *theory of change* or *project logic* could be described with reference to the three key domains in which change is required in order to bring about transformative gender change: If, at the level of individual agency, young women have the knowledge, skills and confidence to take on leadership roles; if, at the level of the social relations of power, young women's male partners or family members and other community gatekeepers (including mature BWF women) are supportive of young women's leadership roles; and if, at the structural level, BWF reforms its structure and organisational culture to be more inclusive and supportive of young women's leadership aspirations; then young women will have a greater voice in local and regional government affairs and policy development and BWF will be strengthened as a sustainable, inclusive representative body for women across Bougainville. In terms of the project's evidence-based objectives and its adoption of best practice gender transformative strategies for achieving these objectives, the YWLP design is relevant and appropriate.

### ACHIEVEMENTS

Relevance to young women beneficiaries. Feedback from young women confirms that YWLP is highly relevant to the interests and needs of young women. Young women in the project said they'd like to see it rolled out across all districts of Bougainville so that more young women can benefit, citing the high demand from communities not targeted by the project. Young women asked that the project continues to support them and the initiatives they have started as a result of the project.

In terms of what YWLP graduates thought most relevant, the highest priority for the majority of young women participants (as well as those not included in the project) was the Financial Literacy and Family Farm Teams (FFT) training, which enabled many to establish and manage a small business. Since many of the young women are very young single mothers or single "Now we are getting requests to roll out our trainings all over Kieta. Some communities have mobilised their young women's groups and want training delivered direct to their community. The billboard in the park, screening the YWLP video has generated great demand, especially for financial literacy training and sustainable livelihood skills." (Young women leader, FGD, Kieta, 16/2/19)

mothers of multiple children and still dependent on their parents, this type of capacity building answered an immediate practical need to generate an income, contribute to the family and/or achieve a measure of self-sufficiency. Women's economic empowerment (WEE) was a constant theme in FGDs and KIIs and seen as empowering on several levels: allowing women to apply their skills to something concrete over which they

could take ownership, providing a measure of economic self-sufficiency, and enabling them to bring income into their families and communities and thereby change perceptions of what young women are capable of. Young WEE has helped create an enabling environment for young women's involvement in other activities, including leadership roles. The importance of WEE for the young women participants was identified in the mid term review (MTR) and resulted in a greater focus on financial literacy and FFT rollout in 2018.

**Relevance to communities.** The significant number of YWLP graduates now in leadership roles in community groups, along with feedback from community leaders that YWLP has improved attitudes and confidence of young women and increased their engagement in community activities and groups, demonstrates the project's relevance at the community level. Young women leaders are highly valued by communities for their sound financial management and tendency to focus on community development, confirming research findings by the World Bank in Bougainville that women leaders prioritise spending on health, education and pro-children infrastructure (as cited by an external stakeholder, KII, Buka, 21/2/19). Relaying feedback from communities, one external stakeholder said: "the YWLP

"You can't deny there is a need for it. Young women are at the very bottom and need to be supported in a range of ways from how to raise a family (be a leader in the family) to leadership at community and national level. It's an effective project and has built capacity of young women leaders at district level." (External stakeholder, KII, Buka, 22/2/19)

proves that if given the opportunity young women can demonstrate ability to contribute to communities" (KII, Buka, 21/2/19). In addition, this key informant felt the involvement of young women leaders in contesting seats in community elections could be leveraged to address gender based violence. "Communities will have more respect for young women as leaders, and this can change attitudes and lead to a reduction in gender based violence" (Ibid).

**Relevance to BWF.** BWF has benefited significantly from the program, with increased capacity in terms of skilled trainers, resources (e.g. tailored *Gud Disisons, Gud Lidasip* manual), relationships with training organisations and structures (i.e. YWAs) through which to organise young women, attract members, and deliver trainings. YWLP has developed the pipeline of leaders for BWF, and – in view of the youth population bulge - thereby increased the organisation's relevance and sustainability. Overall, YWLP has raised the profile of BWF, increased the involvement of young women and improved BWF's sustainability, "young women are now visiting and talking with mature women in DWFs and BWF – which didn't happen before the project – and young women know more about BWF and want the project to be delivered in their own area, which is making a name for BWF" (Staff member, KII, Buka, 22/2/19).

**Relevance to ABG's broader youth agenda**. A spokesperson for DFAT noted the crucial contribution the project was already making to the DFAT funded Bougainville Youth Initiative (BYI), which aims to rebuild the capacity of District Youth Associations (DYAs). Because the network was being rebuilt from scratch, the project had run into difficulties since there were no trained executives to take up leadership roles. YWLP provided vital assistance when young women leaders stepped into these positions. Having seen their continued contribution to effective management and organisation of the DYAs, this external stakeholder expressed the desire to capitalise on young women leaders' leadership skills through a formal affiliation, allowing young women leaders to be identified and integrated into the DYA Executive Committees (External stakeholder, DFAT, KII, Buka, 22/2/19).

### CHALLENGES/LESSONS LEARNED

There is evidence that while YWLP is seen as highly relevant to the needs of young women by young women themselves, communities and stakeholders, the program's focus has been split between responding to the practical economic needs of marginalised and vulnerable rural young women (and the organisational needs of civil society groups) on the one hand, and the political/strategic interests of women who are better placed (in terms of education, resources, support, confidence, mentors, access) to utilise with greatest impact the political skills the program is attempting to nurture, on the other. Evaluation findings raise questions around the effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of a focus on the former, if this comes at the cost of developing the higher level skills young women need to work collectively within and outside BWF, to have a voice in political affairs and policy development.

### 3.2 EFFECTIVENESS

# 3.2.1 TO WHAT EXTENT HAS YWLP ACHIEVED ITS OBJECTIVES AND OUTCOME AREAS?

# OBJECTIVE 1: Young women will have leadership skills and confidence, and a greater voice in government affairs and policy development

#### BASELINE

The baseline research identified two key issues affecting young women's participation in leadership. At the individual level, it found young women felt their lack of skills, knowledge and confidence - to the point of being "crippled by a sense of shame, embarrassment and shyness" (Eves and Koredong 2015, p. 25) - were barriers to their participation and consideration of leadership roles within BWF and other organisations. At the structural level, it found that BWF "operated only at the district level and thus was removed from most women in the community" and in particular from young women who lacked awareness of the organisation and what it did (Eves and Koredong 2015, p. 8).

Informed by these findings, **Objective 1** of YWLP sought to engage and empower young women through a program of activities designed to build their leadership skills and confidence, and increase their voice in government affairs and policy development. These activities aimed to attain five outputs, which collectively would contribute towards this achievement of the objective: <u>Output 1</u>: young women leaders in four target districts identified, trained and mentored; <u>Output 2</u>: a cohort of young women who are putting their skills into practice (at all levels, from community to young women's forum) developed; <u>Output 3</u>: an enabling environment for young women's leadership at community level strengthened; <u>Output 4</u>: Young women's networking skills strengthened and networks at local, national and regional level established; and <u>Output 5</u>: 'safe spaces' for young women within BWF structures created.

#### ACHIEVEMENTS

# Leadership skills and confidence of young women, including the most marginalised (e.g. those living with a disability or in a remote rural area, and/or those who are mothers at a young age), are increased.

There is ample evidence that young women across the four YWLP target districts and North Bougainville have increased confidence and leadership skills as a result of their participation in leadership, gender equality and human rights, SRH, and financial literacy trainings. Young women respondents in FGDs and interviews, as well as the project staff, community members, local leaders and BWF mentors who had observed them, testified that change had taken place across a number of dimensions – in knowledge and attitude (outputs), and behaviour and practice (outcomes).

#### Young women leaders in four target districts are identified, trained and mentored (Output 1)

Achievements in this section focus on the immediate results of YWLP activities designed to engage and empower young women.

**YWLP graduates highly value new knowledge and skills**, especially skills in financial literacy and management, for which there is a high demand from young women in communities not targeted by the project. Many young women participants said these skills had enabled them to better manage household

finances as well as the small income generation initiatives that had been made possible by the program. One young women leader said that through the training she'd received she had "learnt how to manage time and use it well, be patient and face challenges" (FGD, Kieta, 16/2/19). Others mentioned increased skills in management, budgeting and planning, which in one case had resulted in confidence to establish an urban youth association (FGD, Buin, 17/2/19).

Many young women spoke of **changes in attitude, thinking and character leading to changes in how they saw themselves** as well as in how others viewed them. For many young women consulted, one of the most significant changes was in how they perceived themselves. Speaking for her group in Buin, one young women leader said: "We now see ourselves as *somebody* in the community – we learned that we have the "Before I used to drink alcohol and take drugs, but my attitude towards myself has changed. A big change. I gained confidence in public speaking and can now speak publicly without fear. I am taking on responsibilities in the community." (Young women leader, FGD, Wakunai, 14/2/19) right to speak, and we have the confidence to speak out and to older women" (FGD, Buin, 17/2/19). This was confirmed by community leaders in Kieta, who observed that "the project has empowered them [the young women leaders] to speak up and voice out their concerns to others in their community" (Community leaders, FGD, Kieta, 14/2/19). In Torokina, a remote district accessible only by boat, which the evaluation team was unable to visit due to bad weather, the YWA reported that in 2018 young women started participating in community activities (including church, youth groups, health and education) because of their increased confidence after participating in YWLP (IWDA Jul-Dec 2018 Narrative Report, p. 11).

Young women are more confident and identify as leaders in their own communities. A core group of "outstanding and outspoken young women" (BWF staff, KII, Buka, 22/2/19) saw themselves as leaders, **able to speak out on behalf of and organise other young women**. In one community in Northern Bougainville, a young women leader said her confidence to take on responsibilities as a leader inside her community had increased, demonstrated by her new ability to "talk and contribute to discussions" (FGD, Nova, 20/2/19). Another young woman in Kieta, recently elected to the role of treasurer in her youth group, said "I never saw myself as a leader, like the women in the BWF, but now I can be like those leaders. I have the spirit of a leader" (Young women leader, FGD, Kieta, 16/2/19). Some young women consulted for the evaluation said they still did not feel confident to speak out in public and were not ready to take on a leadership role. Yet, as one key informant observed: "Even if she is not a public leader, a young woman leader can be a good leader of her family and a good leader of herself" (Secretariat member, KII, Buka, 21/2/19).

FIGURE 1: Results of Spider Web participatory self-evaluations by young women leaders of skills before and after YWLP





#### A cohort of young women are putting their skills into practice in communities and BWF (Output 2)

Achievements in this section focus on outcomes – the intermediate results of YWLP activities designed to engage and empower young women. In line with the indicator used by the project to demonstrate improved leadership skills and confidence of young women leaders – the '*number of young women representatives in other community groups and structures and the types of involvement in politics, business and community life*' – this section looks at changes in behaviour that demonstrate young women leaders are putting their newfound confidence and skills into practice as leaders.

Young women are knowledgeable and skilled, and are sharing information with their peers in the areas of gender equality and human rights, leadership and financial literacy. There are numerous examples of young women leaders putting their new skills into practice by sharing information with and training others. Many young women leaders are communicating their enthusiasm about the YWLP trainings they have attended, and in all target areas some young women leaders are talking to peers about their rights as women. In Torokina it was reported that after they had attended gender and leadership training, young women and male advocates carried out a mass awareness on human rights and violence, in which they were supported by the whole community (BWF staff member, KII, Buka, 21/2/19). For those young women leaders who had undertaken a Training of Trainers (TOT) there was an enormous boost in confidence in their ability to train peers who had not had the chance to participate in the program. "I'm now interested to work voluntarily with youth and confident to run trainings" (Young women leader, FGD, Wakunai, 14/2/19). And some young women leaders, particularly those who are alumnae of the pilot project in 2015 and have had exposure to many forms of capacity building over several years, have themselves become strong role models to their peers and are mentoring other young women leaders.

Young women are taking up community and political leadership positions. Some young women who attended the leadership training are taking the lead and organising within their Ward. In the absence of a project data base with cumulative totals for the number of young women leaders who have taken up formal leadership positions, the total of 36 young women for 2018 indicates the scale of success. In the July-December 2018 period alone, 13 young women took on new leadership roles: three were appointed as Ward Recorders and one as Ward Secretary in the Community Government (CG) (Kieta, Wakunai and North Bougainville); one was appointed Ward Committee Member for Arawa Urban CG, Kieta; two became members of the Tourism Association Boards in Buin and Kieta; one became Treasurer for Arawa Urban Youth in Kieta; one was elected Vice President for the Catholic Youth in Tonsu, North Bougainville; one became Vice Chair of her parish in Kieta. In addition, four young women ran for election in the 2017 CG elections (YWLP report, Jul–Dec 2018, p. 2).

**Young women are participating in the development of their communities and leading positive change.** There are many examples of young women leaders empowered by YWLP to step up and take on a leadership role though which they seek to achieve change in their community, particularly on behalf of women. "Before the leadership training I lacked confidence to be a leader in the community. YWLP gave me the strength I needed to help other young women who were not part of the project and share what I had learned. I can now stand up and fight for all issues in our community" (Young women leader, FGD, Northern Bougainville, 20/2/19). One young woman who was a leader before joining the program felt empowered to focus on

developmental issues for women: "As a Ward Councillor - both before and after the project -I feel I was empowered to go back to my position to help women on issues that are relevant to them. In my Ward, literacy is a challenge and many women don't know their basic human rights. Single mothers have potential but lack of education is a setback. Information is a tool and as a leader I have influence" (Young women leader, FGD, Northern Bougainville, 20/2/19).

"Before the project I used to hide behind others and push others forward. I lacked confidence. Mentoring I received and participation in events gave me the courage I needed to come out of hiding and last year I was able to stand up and speak out in front of the community. The community saw how much I'd changed and asked me to run in the community government elections. I came second. Next time I will run again." (Young woman leader, FGD, Northern Bougainville, 19/2/19)

#### Through their actions, young women's

**potential for leadership is now recognised by community members**. There is solid evidence to support this claim. For one external stakeholder, the fact that an increasing number of young women "have been taken on board in Community Government" is clear proof that the project has changed community perceptions of young women's ability to lead and contribute to their communities (External stakeholder, KII,

Buka, 21/2/19). Another key informant observed that "generally speaking, after people in the community see the radical change from young women doing nothing to being active community members they see the change and they're happy. When they see the good coming out of young women leaders, community leaders are very supportive" (BWF staff member, KII, Buka, 21/2/19). This was confirmed by another key informant who said that she had seen this firsthand with her own nieces: "Young people are 60% of the population, so when youth are leading people respond well" (BWF Executive, KII, Buka, 19/2/19). For a young woman leader in Kieta "leadership training has taken me to the next level. People in the community recognise me as a leader and are involving us [the Kieta District Young Women's Association (DYWA)] and others" (Young women leader, FGD, Kieta, 16/2/19).

**YWLP alumnae are successful in gaining employment.** The confidence, budgeting skills, and understanding of good leadership and gender equality and experience organising and facilitating workshops make the alumnae of YWLP competitive candidates for employment with non-government organisations (NGOs). Four YWLP alumnae were hired by BWF: one as Finance Assistance, two as Assistant Project Officers, and one (a YWLP alumna and trainer with BWF) leads BWF's participation in the *Womanifesto* program funded by Asia Pacific Forum on Women, Law and Development (APWLD) (IWDA Jul-Dec 2018 Narrative Report, p. 11).

**Young women are taking on leadership roles within BWF**, demonstrating both an achievement for individual young women who have the confidence and skills to represent their members, and an important shift in the culture of BWF (IWDA Jul-Dec 2018 Narrative Report, p. 11). Four young women have taken on leadership roles within their respective DWFs. With "their advanced minute taking skills" (BWF staff, KII, Buka, 21/2/19), three young women now serve as Secretaries for Buin, Tinputz and Torokina District Women's Federations. And one young woman serves as Vice President of the Buka DWF. Henrietta Sinei, president of the Young Women's Caucus group and the Kieta YWA, occupies the newly established role of Young Women's Representative position within the BWF Executive Committee (IWDA Jul-Dec 2018 Narrative Report, p. 11). Some young women have roles in YWAs and DWFs. As detailed below, young women's potential for leadership is now recognised by many mature BWF women and there is greater openness to working together on the part of both younger and mature women BWF members.

Young women trainers are using financial literacy skills to support young women's livelihoods projects and economic empowerment. Increased skills managing money after the 2018 Financial Literacy trainings enabled many young women to start small businesses. One young woman in Kieta started a printing and photocopying business. Now economically independent, she had recently been able to pay her children's school fees of PGK1,600 and is "full of ideas for new projects" (Young women leader, FGD, Kieta, 16/2/19). In Buin, a young woman started a business in fishing, sea cucumbers and printing, and three young women are running a small canteen (IWDA Jul-Dec 2018 Narrative Report, p. 10). Financial literacy training has also benefited young women who were already in business. "I was already a businesswoman. I thought I knew how to run my business, but the Financial Literacy training was something different - it enabled me to set goals and save money" (Young women leader, FGD, North Bougainville, 20/2/19). Young women leaders who are successful in business are passing skills on to others and assisting with start-up loans.

**YWA networks in Kieta and North Bougainville have mobilised groups** of young women into small cooperatives and provided loans or start-up money. In Kieta, the YWA provided start-up capital of PGK250 each for six canteens and two poultry businesses, and the same amount for purchasing roofing iron for an early childhood classroom built by one of their members (Young women leader, FGD, Kieta, 16/2/19). In Nova, North Bougainville, a young woman leader trained 13 young women in her community in financial literacy and, with a loan of PGK300 from a YWLP businesswoman in another Ward, helped set them up in business; one group selling eggs, another noodles and the third Flex (top up phone credit) cards. She reported that prior to the training young women in her community had grown vegetables but always sent them to market with their mothers, being too shy to do it themselves. Now they had the confidence to sell their own produce. In addition to this, young women have increased skills in managing money, and many who work together on joint livelihood ventures now have a locked savings box.

As a result of these activities there have been **positive impacts for some of the most marginalised young women in Bougainville, including single young mothers and young women with a disability**. One young woman leader in Northern Bougainville claimed that "thanks to BWF trainings many single mums can now be self-sufficient" (Young women leader, FGD, Nova, 21/2/19). Respondents in Kieta, Buin and elsewhere in North Bougainville likewise reported that Financial Literacy training had provided many single mothers with an income and a degree of self-sufficiency. A DWF president agreed, highlighting the role this

played in easing the economic burden of families with limited means: "This is important because parents can't provide for the increasing number of dependents as a result of increased numbers of early unwanted pregnancies and single mothers" (KII, Buka, 22/2/19). She also observed that "some young women do well if they have a project to keep them busy", which in this context suggests that providing young women with alternatives to drugs, alcohol and 'parties' keeps them out of 'trouble', including early and unwanted pregnancy.

The evaluation also found one example of the program enabling a young woman living with an intellectual disability in Kieta to achieve greater independence, by equipping her with the skills to start a small market business that she can run without the supervision of her mother (KII, Buka, 21/2/19). While these positive outcomes are *not* the result of policy changes driven by young women leaders, they should be recognised as impacts achieved by young women leaders putting their skills into practice and sharing them with others.

**Cohort of young women trainers established.** YWLP and the *Gud Disisons, Gud Lidasip* training is recognised as an effective approach to empower young women, and young women alumni/trainers are recognised for their expertise (IWDA Jul-Dec 2018 Narrative Report, 2018). Young women trainers have conducted training for youth and young women's programs for partners including Caritas (Bougainville), Voice for Change (Jiwaka), and Wide Bay Conservation Association (East New Britain), including for young women from seven mine-affected communities in Frieda River, West Sepik Province (KII, Buka, 22/2/19).

**Young women leaders are expanding the membership base of their YWAs** by training other young women in financial literacy and facilitating development of livelihood projects. In light of the high value young women place on economic empowerment and its high priority among families and male partners, some young women leaders see financial literacy training and business development as the foundation for future sustainability. "We have other ways to continue training and helping other young women after IWDA exits" (Young women leader, FGD Buka, 20/2/19). In support of this, 14 young women from six districts were trained as trainers for *Gud Disisons, Gud Lidasip*, FFTs, and Games Based Financial Literacy. They will work with DYWAs to roll out trainings to more communities in 2019 (IWDA Jul-Dec 2018 Narrative Report, 2018).

**Young women are using planning and facilitation skills.** Young women leaders used their planning and facilitation skills to organise Young Women's Leadership Forums in 2017 and 2018, and activities for 16 Days of Activism and International Women's Day. In the 2018 Forum, participants worked in district groups to identify key issues and advocacy priorities for young women, and developed key messages for campaigns. As another good example of YWLP graduates using their planning and facilitation skills, community leaders in Northern Bougainville described how the young women leaders they had mentored in their Ward for a year had, on their own initiative, organised a debate in their church, from the idea through to implementation (Community Leaders, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19). It was also reported that young women leaders in Northern Bougainville had helped organise activities for Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC) (Community Leaders, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19).

### ENABLING FACTORS

Young women and others identified several factors they believed had helped young women leaders achieve these outcomes.

**External factors.** Young women said support from others - parents and male partners, community leaders, and women leaders (both within and outside BWF) - was a key enabling factor in utilising their new knowledge and leadership skills, whether in taking up leadership roles in their community, starting a business, educating their peers, or better managing their household finances. This highlights the importance of YWLP's work with gatekeepers who can hinder or help young women put new skills into practice. It was reported, for example, that male advocates trained by YWLP accompanied young women trainers to rural areas and also assisted with setting up small businesses. Likewise, some young women leaders whose male partners had received gender and human rights training said their spouses had cared for children while they attended training or undertook business activities. Ward Members also helped, by giving YWLP graduates roles and responsibilities and mobilising them as a group; and Members of Parliament made donations that were put to use as start-up capital for young women's business enterprises.

The support of key mentors and good role models was highly valued by young women, in particular the sincerity and consistency of their commitment to help young women advance their own interests within decision making fora. The project's promotion of YWLP and its celebration of successful young women leaders through a variety of media – video, print and radio – was motivating for many young women, not only

those featured in this media, or those participating in the program, but those who aspired to achieve what they had seen young women like themselves achieve. As noted above, both young women leaders and community members reported that the screening of the YWLP video in Arawa and Buka generated huge demand for the training from communities not targeted (Young women leader, FGD, Kieta, 16/2/19). The video and the Forums were successful mechanisms for promoting the aims and success of the project to influential stakeholders. One external stakeholder said most of what they had learned about YWLP was through the Young Women's Forum in Buka (KII, Buka, 22/2/19). Finally, and not to be underestimated, the increased focus on young women's economic empowerment during the second half of the project contributed significantly to the creation of an enabling environment. By bringing income into their family young women received increased respect and support for their activities. There was some evidence to suggest that economic independence fosters psychological independence and a greater involvement in household decision making.

**Internal factors.** Mentioned as 'enabling factors' by young women were a number of project outcomes: changed self-perception, the ability to mobilise as a group on fundraising and other activities, working well as a team "understanding each other, hearing all views before making any decision" (Young women leader, FGD, Arawa, 16/2/19), and strong, well organised YWAs.

### CHALLENGES / LESSONS LEARNED

- The more successful participants have been involved in successive BWF projects. The MTR identified a tendency for stronger outcomes among participants and alumni whose training and capacity building had been layered over time through the opportunities provided by successive BWF projects, for example, as research assistants on the Young Women's Leadership Study, then participants in the pilot project, and trainers in the 2016-2018 project.
- Poorer outcomes for young women based in rural settings. The evaluation team was unable to consult directly with young women from outside the district centres except in the case of Wakunai. This could mean there is a limited evidence on results for young women in rural areas, rather than a lack of outcomes per se (See 3.2 Monitoring below). However, there is strong anecdotal evidence that in terms of putting leadership skills into practice, young women in urban areas (Arawa, Buin and Buka towns) have advantages, and significantly better outcomes. They have the support of each other, both informally and within the structure of YWA affiliated to the DWF, the ability to mobilise more easily as a group in order to undertake projects, awareness raising or fundraising activities. When asked about the differences between their context and that of young women in rural areas in their district, urban young women said they had better access to services such as banks and a central market (in which to sell produce), and more reliable communication and transport. They were also better able to seek advice and mentoring from mature DWF members who tended to be based in the district centre, to liaise and collaborate more easily with a variety of NGOs and government bodies, and take advantage of the opportunities for additional training that these relationships might offer.

In contrast, young women based in rural areas, who make up the majority of young women participating in YWLP, are dispersed across the district and isolated from each other, have virtually no access to DWF mentors, and face barriers of poor communication and transport. Because rural communities are more traditional, rural young women are also less likely to have support from parents and partners, more likely to be faced with resistance to the idea of young women playing non-traditional leadership roles and more likely to have lower self-esteem and confidence. In Buin District, seven young women were based in Buin town whilst the remaining 23 were dispersed across the rural areas. When asked about their counterparts in rural areas, these young women said "we don't know what's happening with others in the rural area - we only met them at the 2018 Forum. It's more difficult for them in the village because attitudes are changing more slowly. We only know of two who are doing anything - they have each started a small business. They are role models for other young women in their communities – seeing them motivates others" (Young women leader, FGD, Buin, 17/2/19). It was not known, however, what support these young women were receiving.

It could be concluded, on balance, that **young women participants in rural areas need the most support and follow up after completion of training, but receive the least.** While this claim is yet to be validated by concrete data on the activities of young women in rural areas post-training, comments from a number of community leaders across different districts support this. For example, in Wakunai, a large District with 23 wards (Rau Constituency 12, Terra 11), where the evaluation was told that the 30 young women selected to participate from Wakunai District had been chosen from 20 of these wards, "young women were scattered all over the district so it was hard for them to get together and work as a team. [Alone in their communities], they did not perform because they weren't supported because there was no awareness, Ward Members had not been informed" (Community Leaders, FGD, Wakunai, 14/2/19).

- Limited awareness of project aims at both district and community level, with negative impact on the enabling environment. At the start of YWLP, community consultations were undertaken in the four target districts with local leaders, government officials and members of District Women's Federations, with the aim of explaining the purpose of the Project and ensuring strong support from the beginning. In Kieta and Wakunai, project staff met with Executive Managers of District Government and in Torokina and Buin the Executive Managers attended the first community meetings. Feedback was sought from District Officers of the Department for Community Development, District Women's Federation leaders, Council of Elders and Village Assembly leaders, as well as young women. 'Community mapping' / 'baseline surveys' were also conducted to help District Women's Federations understand the particular needs of their communities. It was reported that "after the consultations there was broad support for what YWLP is trying to achieve" (6-month report Jan-Jun 2016, p. 4). Despite these efforts, many of those consulted for the evaluation reported having limited awareness of the project's aims. This was especially so for those outside of the district centres at CG (formerly 'Ward') and community level, where the majority of young women participating in the project live (FGDs, Wakunai and Kieta community leaders, young women leaders). As a result, there was limited support for young women's leadership.
- DWF members are unclear about YWLP and their role in it. It appears most BWF members at district level have limited understanding of YWLP and its relevance to the DWFs. A YWLP staff member who joined the project at the midway point believed little or no orientation to the project had been conducted with DWFs because when she started "they were asking for information on the 'key concept' of the project" (BWF staff, KII, Buka, 21/2/19). In an FGD in Wakunai, young women reported that while their relationship with individual DWF members was cordial, networking between their respective bodies - the YWA and DWF - was poor. DWF members had not met with the Wakunai YWA, and in their own meetings appeared to "mostly talk about older women's issues among themselves and only help when a training workshop is held in the district" (Young women leader, FGD, Wakunai, 14/2/19). The absence of productive working relationships between the DWFs and the YWAs was a recurring theme in the evaluation, with one young woman saying: "The leaders were alright at the Young Women's Forum - they were there and participating, but back in the community there is no link with the BWF or DWF leaders" (Young women leader, FGD, Buka, 21/2/19). According to another, "we don't see a good connection between the mature BWF women and young women at district level, in fact there is no linking with young women at any level" (Young women leader, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19). The same issue was identified in the MTR in 2017, which found that while the YWAs had been an effective structure for implementing YWLP activities, poor linking to DWFs had hindered their potential to improve young women's representation within the BWF structure (MTR, p. 3). In this regard it appears little has changed, demonstrating that BWF's commitment to support young women leaders within the organisation had not been translated into action at DWF level. One reason for this, suggested at the data analysis workshop, was the possibility that half-way through the project there had been a change in the Executives of target DWFs and/or Regional BWF leaders and these new leaders had not been fully briefed (Data analysis workshop, Buka, 25-26/2/19). It is also possible there was a lack of clarity on the objectives of the project vis-a-vis the strengthening and sustainability of BWF, and a perception that the project was primarily for the benefit of young women leaders. This raises the question of the extent to which BWF has promoted young women's leadership outside of project activities. This is discussed in more detail later in the report under Objective 2.

Limited effective consultation and collaboration with Community and District Governments (and other organisations). It would appear that lack of a mechanism to link YWLP graduates in rural areas with local governments, government agencies and community organisations has contributed to limited utilisation of the new leadership skills acquired by YWLP graduates. Speaking of the disconnect between the Department for Community Development's (DCD) DYAs and the DWFs/YWAs, one key informant stated: "Initially the trained and capacitated young women leaders were not well utilised because [on the one hand] the DCD district offices did the selection of young people for the newly formed DYAs and many overlooked the young women leaders. [On the other] BWF/DWF was not supporting District Youth Associations in the sense that they were not actively promoting or facilitating deployment of YWLP 'graduates' into roles in these associations where they can use their skills" (External stakeholder, KII, Buka, 22/2/19). This was confirmed by several community leaders who said that with little or no

understanding of YWLP and no mechanism by which to facilitate collaboration they were not well positioned to mobilise and coordinate the activities of YWLP graduates at CG (Ward) level.

• Poor or no networking/linkages between BWF/DWF and communities. The baseline research noted that "a considerable number of groups exist *at community level* [my emphasis] in the districts" (Eves and Koredong 2015, p. 21), e.g. church groups, youth groups and sporting groups. The research stressed that together these groups provided a wide range of leadership opportunities for young women across Bougainville and should not be overlooked as a proven pathway for participation and leadership in women's organisations (Eves and Koredong 2015, p. 22). In undertaking the responsibility "Young women leaders need to be a more organised group at Ward level and integrated within the Community Government structure, based on their experience. Community Governments could identify a project for the young women leaders and provide financial management and project management capacity building and give each one roles and responsibilities so they can take ownership." (Community Leaders, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19)

assigned to them (see above) for encouraging and supporting other young women to participate in such groups, young women leaders encountered a number of challenges: community leaders lacked understanding of YWLP and questioned activities (though welcomed them once they understood it); young women leaders' efforts to conduct awareness in their community after receiving training were ineffective as many did not have 'big picture' knowledge of the YWLP objectives, having joined half-way through the program and missed initial key trainings; many likely had a low level of literacy, as acknowledged by project staff (KII, Buka, 22/2/19).

Some young women leaders had been subjected to considerable resistance and interference from community leaders. For one very active group of young women in a community in North Bougainville, the

attitudes of male relatives and older women were a problem. Compounding these challenges to effective networking between BWF, DWFs, YWAs and rural communities, were poor communication, lack of transport, distance between young women leaders dispersed across the district, and cost of funding travel and outreach activities (Young women leader FGD and male advocates FD, Buin, 17/2/19; Young women leaders FGD, Kieta, 15/2/19).

"They are demanding to be informed in writing of every activity the young women undertake (e.g. training or awareness) and we have to pass on all information from BWF. There is a lack of information on the project and confusion in the community. If the constituency BWF representative came and did awareness with Ward leaders it would help." (Young women leader, FGD, Buka, 21/2/19)

- Lack of funding for start-up capital to establish small businesses, conduct training, undertake community outreach and awareness activities. Young women have demonstrated that lack of start-up capital is not necessarily a barrier to establishing small businesses and some have framed the ability to fundraise to cover the cost of doing this themselves as a strength. It can be seen as increasing sustainability and giving young women space to lead. However, this has not been the case for young women and YWAs in all locations. In Buin, for example, located quite remotely in the far south of Bougainville, young women leaders and male advocates independently raised the issue of lack of funding to take training and community outreach on gender and human rights to locations in rural areas.
- Issues relating to selection of young women participants. With the aim of avoiding the charge of

nepotism, the project employed a rigorous, open and transparent process to recruit 30 young women from each target district. While this ensured young women from all areas in the target districts had a chance to participate, including those who lived in remote areas, some community leaders felt this had resulted in too large a range of confidence and ability in terms of previous leadership experience, level of education and status within their community. Combined with large disparities in levels of confidence between young women leaders, they saw the impact playing out once young women returned to their communities after training. Some young women had put their new skills into practice but others, especially those lacking confidence and self-esteem, and with no status or previous leadership experience in their community, had done nothing. This clearly links to issues of support for young women after training, as mentioned above.

Another issue reported to have had an impact on the performance of young women leaders was the relatively high turnover of young women in the project. A number of young women dropped out for various reasons - employment, study, marriage – and when places were vacated, they were quickly filled due to the high demand for the training. This meant not all participants had completed all training and those who came later may not have completed basic leadership, gender and human rights training, which was thought to have impacted their leadership capacity. A database had been set up to keep track of participants and training and support needs, but with a change of project staff midway through the project, data entry was discontinued. While it was beyond the control of the project to prevent young women who left from 'dropping out', it would have been beneficial to provide those who joined half-way through with the full complement of training that had been offered up to that point.

• Low self-esteem prevents some young women from putting new skills into practice. A number of mentors and community members raised this as a serious issue.

### RECOMMENDATIONS

To ensure utilisation of young women's leadership skills and address many of the challenges detailed above, the following two strategies or models could be considered:

- 1. **Supporting individual young women leaders in their communities.** This would involve strengthening the links between young women and their communities (from village to CG level) to create an enabling environment for young women to take up leadership roles, including:
  - Developing a YWLP project orientation package for use at community and CG level to ensure chiefs and leaders in the communities from which YWLP participants are drawn understand YWLP, its objectives and approach;
  - Mapping out stakeholders and potential partners at village and CG level and link young women participants with mentors and potential leadership roles from the beginning of their participation in the project;
  - Giving young women a voice in community meetings by instituting formal representation from young women in community structures;
  - Involving chiefs and community leaders in the leadership and gender trainings, and provide orientation and training to community level mentors;
  - Strengthening networking between YWLP participants in rural areas and their district YWAs;
  - Monitoring the activities of young women leaders in their communities after training.
- 2. **Supporting groups of young women leaders at CG level.** This would involve focusing on establishing and mobilising groups of young women at CG level by setting up a mechanism/criteria for formal collaboration. Delivery of training and support would be more cost effective and young women would gain confidence and support from mobilising as a group. This option would not exclude the recruitment of individual young women into CG or community group leadership roles. The strategy could be pursued by:
  - Developing a YWLP project orientation package for use at CG level to ensure all stakeholders understand YWLP, its objectives and approach;
  - Developing a process for selection of young women participants at CG level in consultation with relevant CG stakeholders (this could be facilitated by BWF constituency members) and setting up young women's groups at CG level;
  - Delivering training to groups of young women at CG (not district) level;
  - Integrating young women's groups into CG structures by involving them in activities that the CG steering committee may plan in the community and/or invite the group to plan a project in

consultation with steering committee and aligned with community needs. Assign roles and responsibilities, provide supervision and mentoring on project management, and monitor performance;

- Facilitate exchange visits between CG young women's groups and/or organise a forum at District level to enable networking, mutual learning and exchange;
- If funding permitted, recruit a Development Officer at District level to coordinate delivery of training, conduct support visits, assist YWA to organise District level Young Women's Leadership Forum, etc.
- To address the issue of low confidence and self-esteem as a barrier to young women's leadership, review YWLP trainings to incorporate best practice in building confidence and **self-esteem** in the Pacific region, e.g. by adapting from Young Women's Christian Association's *Rise Up* Program. In addition, identify less confident young women leaders early and provide dedicated follow up and mentoring support. And provide young women with incentives to actively engage and participate in conducting awareness on gender issues with their peers, for example, by providing in-kind contributions such as stationery and umbrellas.
- Re-establish the non-functioning DWFs and include young women in DWF Executive Committees.

# An enabling environment for women's leadership at the community level is strengthened through awareness raising at the district level and working with male advocates (<u>Output 1.3</u>)

#### BASELINE

The YWLP baseline study noted that gender inequitable attitudes widely held by both men and women in Bougainville exert strong cultural pressure to conform to culturally defined gender roles (Eves and Koredong 2015, p. 14). As young women are among the least powerful and most vulnerable in Bougainville society, it is not surprising that when pursuing leadership roles, they face significant cultural barriers in the form of resistance from family, husbands and other gatekeepers in the community, including older women, whose attitudes toward younger women, the baseline research found, could be discriminatory and undermining (Ibid).

Two strategies in YWLP were designed to address the most proximate barriers to young women's participation, both in project training, events and activities and in the non-traditional roles that young women leaders may aspire to take on after training. A male advocate's strategy was designed to engage male partners of young women leaders as supporters of their spouses and advocates of the program. This involved separate and joint sessions (with young women leaders) on gender, human rights, violence etc. for young men related to the young women participants. Another strategy was developed to involve older women in mentoring, with the twofold aim of enabling young women to learn from practical involvement in the work of the older women while giving older women insights into the thinking and aspirations of young women. Young women participants were to be paired with older women leaders, including BWF executives, BWF staff engaged in the electoral education program, women candidates, civil servants, businesswomen, and NGO staff. This aimed to bridge the gap between the generations and to create a more supportive environment for young women in decision making and leadership spaces.

### ACHIEVEMENTS

Active male champions have been very supportive (Young women leader, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19). Male advocates in patrilineal Buin had provided strong support to young women leaders delivering financial literacy and FFT training in the district. They have provided security for young women trainers travelling out to rural

"Women don't have the weight; they need male help to support them. We can convince people in the community to support young women's right to participate. They won't listen to women." (Male Advocates, FGD, Buin, 17/2/10) areas and helped young women broker relationships with communities. The have also provided assistance with setting up small businesses. Some male advocate partners of young women leaders have been extremely supportive, taking on non-traditional household duties such as caring for children while young women are engaged in activities outside the home. Some have cleared land for growing vegetables for sale. It was reported that "men were involved mostly in supporting big events, such as the march against violence during 16 days of activism – they were active champions and really supportive" (Young women leader, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19). The male advocates strategy was designed "to prevent the process of individual transformation from occurring in a vacuum and to assist in creating new, more equitable social structures" (YWLP Project Proposal, pp. 7-8). The evaluation found, however, that few community outreach and awareness activities on gender and human rights had been conducted by male advocates. Young women leader project managers acknowledged that the strategy has been more effective in mitigating the risk of male partner retaliation than contributing to social norm change in the wider community.

Delivery of financial literacy and business development training is an effective enabling strategy. Responding to the demand for financial and business training from young women participants, YWLP shifted focus midway through, from an emphasis on women's strategic needs (increasing their voice and participation in all levels of decision making) to the practical needs that young women themselves perceived as immediate priorities, i.e. income generation, sustainable livelihoods and economic empowerment. This shift has generated a 'virtuous circle' of change, whereby young women bringing income into the home have received increased respect and appreciation, along with support for their activities, often in the form of males undertaking more household tasks. The outcome is a more supportive environment for young women leaders.

"One mature woman leader and former BWF Executive member had reservations about the YWLP and didn't believe young women could be leaders. But at the North Forum last year she was greatly impressed with a group of voung women and their outspokenness and presentation on women and girls' issues. She openly congratulated one particular young woman, stating 'this young woman knows what she wants and has truly set principles for her life'." (BWF management, KII, Buka, 21/2/19)

**Young women and mature women within BWF are working more effectively together**. While views within BWF were mixed as to the extent to which attitudes, working relationships and sharing of decision making (power sharing) between mature and younger women had improved by the end of the project, it was widely acknowledged that a significant shift had occurred, through a combination of young women gaining the confidence and skills they needed to 'step up' and work with mature BWF women, and through the mentoring provided by a small group of dedicated mature BWF women. "Young women learned they had leadership qualities and the right to be involved in leading – in their communities and in BWF. Young women have the confidence to participate in discussions with mature women and contribute their ideas. Some are already in the spotlight and mature women leaders are recognising their qualities. Young women have become organised" (KII, Project staff, Buka, 22/2/19).

It was recognised that progress was uneven. Some young women are benefiting from consistent and passionate mentoring by mature women in BWF, who believe in young women, involve them, build their capacity and link them with community leaders or government bodies. But many – and possibly the majority – have not, since mentoring has taken place primarily at district level and was reported to be more advanced in North Bougainville, which – as the site of the Pilot Young Women's Leader project and the base for many alumnae who had benefitted from exposure to multiple forms of capacity building, training and mentoring – is considered more progressive. "I can really see the difference especially in the north. Young women are willingly working with mature women as a team. We had the North Forum last year and many young women came and the mature women embraced them" (BWF Management, KII, Buka, 21/2/19).

### CHALLENGES / LESSONS LEARNED

Young women leaders reported that there is still considerable resistance from families, male partners and others in the community. "Parents still have negative perception of the project and discourage their daughters from participating. Then I talked to them and explained the aims of the project. Once they understood, they were happy for their daughters to attend" (Young women leader, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19).

#### Male advocates

• At the output level, the evaluation found inconsistencies in the implementation of the male advocacy strategy, including variations in the type and length of training delivered. For example, during the 2017 Young Women's Forum in Buka, CARE was engaged to deliver training that was half the length of their standard training, did not include women (as they believed it should), and did not allow time for participants to develop action plans. This differed from training delivered by the Nazareth Centre for Rehabilitation, in a program which the evaluation team was told in Buin had a coordinator who supported and monitored all male advocates' activities.

In general, it was reported that active male champions were 'really supportive'. However, they themselves received no support from YWLP and their activities were not monitored (Young women leader, FGD, Buka). The evaluation team spoke with two experienced and active male advocates in Buin who had received several types of training from different NGOs over several years. They were not related to any of the YWLP participants, but had accompanied them during young women leaders' delivery of FFT and financial literacy training, promoted the program to communities and assisted with new business initiatives. They felt their experience conducting gender and human rights awareness in communities could contribute to positive social norm change but lack of funds limited their ability to do so (Male advocates FGD, Buin, 17/2/19).

- Not all male partners of young women participating in the program underwent male advocacy training
  and some of these young women said they constitute the biggest obstacle they face. Many young women
  participants reported that their husbands/partners did not trust them and saw attendance at training and
  other events that took place away from home as opportunities for infidelity. Some young women also
  reported that their spouses felt threatened and intimidated by their newfound skills and activities outside
  the home.
- Many young women reported that male partners expected their participation in the program to bring some financial return, although this was said to differ between locations depending on spouse education level. It was not surprising to find, therefore, that the delivery of financial literacy and business development training resulting in increased income for the household proved an effective enabling strategy. There was evidence to suggest that this outcome promoted a 'virtuous circle' of change in which young women's ability to bring income into the home generated support for their involvement in project activities, including their assumption of leadership roles. While it was beyond the scope of the evaluation to explore decision making within the home on the use of this income and the extent to which increased income changed or perpetuated gender inequality within households, there were no reports of issues/risks relating to increased income, even among young women whose partners had not undergone 'male advocacy' training and felt emotionally threatened or jealous of their female partner's new skills and status.
- Project staff acknowledge that the male advocates strategy has at best mitigated the risk of opposition and possibly retaliation for those young women whose spouses participated in the program, but overall has had little impact in contributing to more gender equitable attitudes in the broader community.

#### Mentoring by mature BWF women

It is agreed there is still much room for improvement in relation to mentoring of young women leaders. According to a BWF Program Manager (and former BWF Project Coordinator), "about half the mature women in BWF have changed their attitude towards young women but a large number still don't want to give space to young women and it's only the outspoken young women leaders who are currently involved" (Project staff, KII, Buka, 22/2/19).

- The project lacked a systematic approach to mentoring. Reported by a key informant and evident in project documents was a plan to establish criteria for selecting and orienting mentors, and matching them with young women participants in a structured process of one-on-one mentoring, either within an organisation or through mentor and mentee working side by side on a project or activity. A mentoring guide was completed in the first year of the project but was never used, reportedly after budget calculations revealed a lack of funding to cover the cost of bringing young women from rural communities to the district centres where the mature women mentors were based (BWF staff, KII, Buka, 22/2/19). There was no terms of reference (TOR) for selecting and deploying mentors, no orientation and no training, for either mature women mentors or young women mentees. In one district the main mentor passed away leaving the young women without vital coordination, after which the YWA disbanded, which underlines both the need for mentors and a more structured approach to mentoring.
- Persistent attitude of mature BWF leaders. As part of the baseline surveys conducted during community consultations, experienced women leaders were surveyed on their willingness to work as mentors with young women participants. "We found very few who were willing to come out and give their time freely," a former project officer reported. One mature woman surveyed had reportedly said: "We came up the hard way and these young women are getting this on a golden plate" (KII, Buka, 21/2/19). This response, which encapsulates an attitude held by many mature BWF members toward young women members, was identified in the Eves and Koredong research as a key issue to be addressed by the YWLP. Because so few mature women within BWF were willing to be mentors, it was decided that a workable alternative strategy to the formal mentoring process would be to invite mature BWF leaders to

attend trainings to share their experience. As a result of compromising the original strategy, few BWF mentors saw mentoring of young women as part of their role.

- Because few DWF members saw the YWLP and mentoring young women leaders as part of their role only a small number of DWF members were involved in mentoring young women leaders. This observation was offered by the participants in the YWLP Evaluation's Data Analysis Workshop (which included members of the BWF Executive Committee and Secretariat). They also felt the converse was true that young women participants in YWLP did not have an expectation that mature BWF women would provide mentoring and were not proactive in finding a mentor (BWF Data Analysis Workshop, Buka, 25-26/2/19). Among DWF members who were prepared to mentor, there was a general expectation of receiving an allowance for this, especially if it involved travelling to rural areas (some said this was a precedent set by providing allowances for mature women to attend YWLP trainings and/or to accompany young women leaders to Forums).
- Young women leaders are not often included in core BWF representational and advocacy work. Young women leaders in Buka raised this issue a number of times (Young women leader, FGD, Malasang, 20/2/19) and also drew attention to an example of normal practice by mature BWF women during the YWLP Evaluation's Data Analysis Workshop. Mature women members of the Executive Committee and the Secretariat took time out to meet with the United Nations (UN) to discuss referendum readiness. On return, when pointed out to them that they'd not asked a young woman to accompany them to the meeting they acknowledged that it had not occurred to them to do so.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

#### General

- 'Do no harm'/support strategy: At the least, to ensure YWLP participants are not exposed to the risk of retaliation from male partners or family members who may feel threatened or intimidated by young women's new skills and opportunities outside the home, develop a YWLP male supporter training package and provide training to the male partners, brothers, fathers, etc. of each young woman participant. In particular, address male concerns that women are 'wasting' time on activities (whether trainings, meetings, leadership roles, etc.) outside the home for which there is no financial return. Consider incorporating income generation activities as one strategy to counter this. In line with best practice in gender training, ensure men and women are trained together, as this provides an opportunity for sharing different gender perspectives and promoting mutual understanding and a shared vision. Monitor male supporters' attitudes (via their partners) and activities (if they go beyond adopting a supportive role), and provide positive feedback and recognition.
- Advocacy strategy: This option could be considered if an opportunity arises (through funding or partnership, e.g. with Nazareth Centre for Rehabilitation) to take male support of individual YWLP participants to the next level. This would involve training male supporters to advocate for social norm change in the broader community. In addition to basic male supporter training, male advocates would be trained in conducting activities in the community to promote more gender equitable attitudes. Advocates would develop action plans, receive support to implement these, and their activities would be monitored to capture achievements and learning for identifying best practice for improvement. They would be provided positive feedback and recognition.

#### • For both 'support' and 'advocacy' strategies:

- If district level Young Women's Forums were to take place, male supporters and/or male advocates could participate, share their experience, network and use the opportunity to review their own advocacy activity plans in light of learning from others. This would also present an opportunity for the joint development of advocacy campaigns at a ward, constituency or district level;
- If YWAs become formally affiliated with DYAs, explore options for recruiting male DYA members as advocates for young women leaders.
- Engage male Ward Members to speak out at community level on the aims and benefits of the Young Women's Leadership activities for the whole community. Gender training could be offered.
- Develop YWLP mentors and mentees training packages including TOR, orientation, training and support. Mentors might be mature BWF women and other women leaders in the community, as well young women leaders who are able and willing to mentor their peers; mentees would be young women participants in YWLP. The involvement of both mentors and mentees will ensure shared expectations of the mentoring relationship.

- Provide financial and in-kind support to mentors. Explore options for providing allowances to cover the cost of travel and accommodation for mentors travelling to rural areas or young women travelling in and incentives (e.g. in the form of trainings, workshops, conferences). Provide positive feedback and recognition to mentors and opportunities to share and learn from each other. This could take place at DWF meetings, or more formally in Congress meetings or at Young Women's Forums if they continue to take place, either at district or national level. Monitor mentoring provided (disaggregated by mentors and mentees, age, and BWF/non-BWF members).
- **BWF.** Take steps to increase the involvement of young women in mature women's program activities beyond participation in trainings, e.g. Women's Action for Voice and Empowerment (WAVE) trainings, Annual General Meetings (AGMs) and Congresses, high level meetings with stakeholders.

# Young women's networking skills are strengthened and networks established at local and regional level (<u>Output 1.4</u>)

### ACHIEVEMENTS

YWAs were established in the four target districts (Wakunai, Kieta, Buin and Torokina) and in five CG areas in North Bougainville. Three out of four YWAs consulted are still functioning (Wakunai YWA's Executive Committee had reportedly disbanded and the status of the other four in North Bougainville is unknown). A key aim of the YWAs was to develop a support network for young women's leadership across Bougainville. For young women participants who have access to the associations (those in proximity to urban centres), the YWAs have proved effective mechanisms for mobilising members for fundraising and income generation. Working in and as a group has enabled young women leaders to develop a shared vision and work towards achieving it together. While the focus of collective action to date has been helping group members and other young women in their communities establish small business ventures, rather than working together on advocacy campaigns, the experience of collective action has clearly strengthened their networking skills at local level.

Feedback from both young women leaders and community members also confirms that the YWAs have continued to be an effective structure through which to roll out trainings and awareness on gender equality and life skills in target districts. These include trainings funded by the project and delivered by young women's leadership trainers in each district, such as the 22 activities implemented by the project in 2018, including 13 training workshops (three TOTs in Integrated Agricultural Training Programs, Games Based Financial Literacy, *Gud Disisons, Gud Lidasip*, two SRH trainings, four Financial Literacy trainings and four FFT trainings). YWAs were also instrumental in organising the Young Women's Forums, the International Women's Day celebration and 16 Days of Activism events (IWDA Jul-Dec 2018 Narrative Report, 2018).

### CHALLENGES/LESSONS LEARNED

- Unreliable communication networks and transport along with lack of funding are barriers to YWAs networking with their members in rural areas.
- Communication and networking between YWAs and DWFs is poor. One key informant observed that at national level the presidents of the two bodies (BWF and YWA) communicate and at the local level young women communicate with their mentors, but at the district level "mentors need to more actively involve young women leaders in DWF to make them comfortable so they can transition confidently into DWF once they turn 30 years of age. Currently the two bodies are operating quite independently in parallel" (KII, Buka, 22/2/19). This confirms the MTR's finding that poor communication and networking between YWAs and DWFs is limiting the potential of YWAs to elevate young women's representation within the BWF structure by 'transitioning', with DWF mentoring, from YWAs into DWFs. In the absence of adequate support and/or leadership, YWAs are vulnerable to disbanding, and to limiting their focus to income generation. In Wakunai, for example, although the relationship with BWF was described as good, the DWF had not met with young women in the YWA and at the loss of its key mentor (the District DCD Officer) and the onset of internal conflict, the YWA had disbanded (Young women leader, FGD, Wakunai, 14/2/19).
- As noted elsewhere in the evaluation, feedback from a number of stakeholders suggests limited recognition by and integration with government structures and government departments is a barrier to the effective functioning of YWAs (Community leaders, FGDs, Wakunai and Buka, 14/2/19 and 20/2/19).
- It was reported that although many youths participate in sporting events in rural areas, few of these groups are registered as YWAs with BWF.

### RECOMMENDATIONS

- Strengthen the relationship between YWAs and DWFs.
- To extend the reach of YWAs to young women in rural areas (and secure funding in the short term) ensure YWAs are recognised and positioned to collaborate with district and local government departments at all levels; YWAs with the DYAs; and register Ward level associations such as sports clubs with YWAs/BWF.

#### Safe Spaces are established for young women within the BWF Structures (Output 1.5)

### ACHIEVEMENTS

The 2017 Young Women's Leadership Forum, the first of its kind in Bougainville, was designed to create a space for young women to share experiences, learn from one another, build networks and solidarity across Bougainville and beyond, and advocate for change.

The 2018 Young Women's Leadership Forum built on the first forum and included sustainability planning for the YWAs to continue leading change after the conclusion of the project (IWDA Jul-Dec 2018 Narrative Report, 2018). One hundred and eighty-four people participated in the 2018 Young Women's Leadership Forum in Arawa. The theme of the forum was "Break the Silence! Hear Our Voice!". Young women from North Bougainville, Buin, Wakunai, Torokina and Kieta districts were joined by young women leaders from partners across Papua New Guinea, Solomon Islands and Fiji to share experiences and learning, strengthen networks between young women from different districts, build solidarity with national and regional young women's movements and create sustainability plans for 2019 (IWDA Jul-Dec 2018 Narrative Report, 2018).

In response to the limited participation of young women in decision making in BWF, as identified by the baseline research, the Young Women's Caucus was established in 2017 and in 2018 a Young Women's Representative was appointed to the Executive Committee of BWF.

Indicators for this output – which was not included in the original Monitoring and Evaluation Framework – include the number of women participating in the Young Women's Leadership Forum, the number of young women members participating in the youth caucus and the number of motions the youth caucus is able to get passed through BWF structures.

### CHALLENGES/LESSONS LEARNED

• Currently Young Women's Caucus meetings take place after trainings and therefore do not require dedicated funding. If future trainings are funded by YWAs themselves and more localised in nature, the impetus for Caucus meetings may wane.

# <u>OBJECTIVE 2</u>: BWF is strengthened as a sustainable, inclusive representative body for women across Bougainville.

In assessing the outcomes of YWLP towards achieving this objective, the evaluation refers to the research conducted prior to the pilot YWLP in 2015.

#### BASELINE

At the organisational level, the research identified several factors inhibiting young women's participation in BWF, including lack of awareness on the part of young women, and more broadly, about BWF and its work. The following response, cited in the research, represents this perception: "I've heard about BWF. I know of the organisation, but I don't often see any work at the community level. We are often told that we are under BWF's network, but in reality there is nothing to show for it. BWF must initiate some innovative skills trainings at the village level, so that women can see for themselves that BWF exists" (Eves and Koredong 2015, p. 24). Another key issue identified was strained relationships between mature and younger women within BWF. This included the absence of mutual respect and younger women's experience of being excluded from participation in mature women's groups and discussions. While some young women also raised concerns about nepotism in relation to BWF governance, young women also expressed a desire and willingness to work with experienced women leaders. At the same time, BWF's commitment to undertake the research reflected the recognition among BWF leaders that the organisation needed to do more to engage and involve young women (Eves, p. 24-6).

Based on the research findings it was recommended that if BWF was to survive and grow it would need to increase awareness of the organisation, reform its structures, operations and processes to be more inclusive of younger women, and encourage greater participation by younger generations. This was to be achieved by being more proactive at community level of BWF and increasing awareness of the importance of women's leadership across Bougainville, with particular focus on the districts. In addition, BWF should create a 'Young Women's Caucus' that would be represented in the BWF Executive, actively seeking the views of young women and address issues relevant to them (Eves, p. 9). It was also recommended that BWF's overall management capacity be strengthened, to ensure its successful scale-up and delivery of YWLP.

#### ACHIEVEMENTS

There is increased awareness of BWF and the importance of women's leadership across Bougainville, with particular focus on the districts. Due to YWLP's success, communities and other stakeholders have seen young women take up leadership roles and start small businesses after receiving leadership and financial literacy/business skills training. Through the positive contribution young women have subsequently made to their families and communities, YWLP has heightened awareness of the importance of women's leadership – in particular young women's leadership – across Bougainville. This is evident in the high number of requests for the YWLP trainings in non-targeted districts, as community leaders and families began to recognise young women's leadership potential and benefits. BWF as the implementing organisation has enjoyed a boost to its public profile. It is likely exposure has been highest at national level and among national level stakeholders such as DCD, UN Women and ABG. However, one BWF regional president and one DWF president reported some improvement in the visibility of the DWFs.

### ENABLING FACTORS

- Word of mouth about YWLP was spread by participants after the delivery of trainings in the districts.
- Communities responded positively to YWLP being delivered by a BWF rather than an international NGO and positive images of YWLP and BWF were mutually reinforcing.
- YWLP produced a range of media to promote and publicise the outcomes of the project, including:
  - "Be the Change" a video highlighting young women leaders, which aims to change perceptions of young women as leaders and to promote BWF as the organisation supporting them. The video is displayed several time daily on large public video screens in the population centres of Arawa and Buka towns;
  - Booklet profiling outstanding young women leaders in the target districts and North Bougainville;
  - Interviews with young women leaders (by a young woman journalist) broadcast on radio across Bougainville.
- Feedback from young women leaders and community members confirm the video and radio features were effective in promoting both the success of the project and young women's leadership.

### CHALLENGES/LESSONS LEARNED

There was feedback from some quarters that BWF - as opposed to YWLP - was still ineffective in reaching out to communities, and engaging with and reporting to the women whose interests it claimed to represent: "As an organisation for all women in Bougainville, BWF is OK. But when we are registering our community women's organisation under BWF, how are they helping us women? They are not going out and explaining BWF at the community level" (Young women leader, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19). There appears to be little evidence that BWF has gone beyond scheduled YWLP activities to actively promote the organisation at grassroots level. This is likely due to a perception by DWF leaders that YWLP was promoting BWF (largely through the efforts of project staff and YWLP participants) and therefore did not require further input from DWFs.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- **BWF**. In light of YWLP's completion and the cessation of project funding for any ongoing activities, explore strategies for more active engagement by DWFs and YWAs in promoting the organisation at grassroots level. This could be via joint campaigns, which would also encourage collaboration between DWFs and YWAs (mature and younger women), thereby helping to breach the current separation.
- BWF. As detailed below, reactivate or explore options for developing an effective system by which to: a) communicate the needs and interests of BWF grassroots members to the Executive Committee, and b) report on outcomes of BWF's advocacy on these issues back to the women they represent. Ultimately, a representative organisation is only as strong as its members, the strength of whose support for BWF
women leaders (from local to national level) will rest on their understanding of how BWF leaders and BWF as an organisation represents and furthers their interests.

#### BWF is a more inclusive and representative body for women across Bougainville

#### Organisational structure ACHIEVEMENTS

YWAs have been established in each district. This has provided a safe space for networking and peer support at district level. It has also been the catalyst for livelihood initiatives which contributed funding towards further training opportunities for young women (see above). In addition to YWAs, BWF implemented reforms that engaged and recognised young women's representation the through the establishment of the Young Women Leaders' Caucus, which serves as an umbrella group for the YWAs providing a platform for young women to consolidate and prioritise their interests across the Autonomous Region of Bougainville (ARB) and represent them to the BWF at national level through the newly created position of a young woman representative on the BWF Executive Committee.

#### **ENABLING FACTORS**

An enabling factor here was clearly the evidence provided by the research on which the recommendations
for structural change were based. Underlying this research, as the research report itself pointed out, is
the recognition among BWF leaders that the organisation needed to do more to engage and involve
young women to ensure sustainability. Ultimately, BWF's willingness to institute change is based on the
understanding that this is in the best interests of the organisation.

#### CHALLENGES / LESSONS LEARNED

"We don't see a good connection between the mature BWF women and young women at district level, in fact there is no linking with young women at any level." (Young woman leader, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19)

*"In North, coordination is lacking at the district level. We need to strengthen BWF at the district level."* (North Regional President, Buka, 20/2/19)

"BWF doesn't reach down to the district. It exists in name only. We don't know their plans and programs. DWF level networking is OK but not from the top down. The system is not functioning well." (DWF President Buin, KII, Buin, 17/2/19) "I want to see [young women] involved actively in BWF decision making, not just representation. They should take on leadership at federation level. The composition of the Executive Committee should reflect the balance of interests and needs between young and mature women." (ABG DCD Secretary, KII, Buka, 22/2/19)

Is one young women leader in the BWF Executive Committee enough? Although young women have achieved national-level representation within BWF through establishment of a position for one young woman on the BWF Executive Committee, many young and mature women and stakeholders already see the need to improve on this. They argue that while young women can now represent their own interests within BWF, this could remain tokenistic if not matched by a meaningful level of participation in decision making at national level, reflecting the fact that 60% of the population are 'youth'. This issue is made more pressing by the observation that the Young Women's Forum remains the key space in which young women's interests are raised and advocacy conducted (BWF staff, KII, Buka, 22/2/10), but may be in doubt after funding through YWLP ceases. Similar doubts have been cast over the future of the young women's Caucus, beyond the life of YWLP. As noted elsewhere in the report, some senior BWF women leaders have also expressed the view that mature women should step back and allow several suitably competent and committed young women to step up. While for some mature BWF women this constitutes a dangerous leap rather a considered move in the right direction, there is a clearly a need for discussion of these issues and of succession planning more specifically.

• **Coordination, collaboration and reach within BWF**. As detailed above, it is acknowledged that inadequate coordination and reach within BWF and its constituents in the community is an impediment to the effective inclusion and representation of all women in Bougainville, including young women. Creation of YWAs empowered young women in many ways (as detailed elsewhere in this report); however, due to poor networking and collaboration between YWAs and DWFs these district level associations have not been leveraged to deepen the inclusion of young women and their interests within BWF more broadly. Issues were found to vary by region. Respondents in the North identified the problem as one of communication and coordination at district level. In the South, where communication and transport are barriers and districts have to rely more on their own resources (which may foster greater collaboration) respondents saw the key problem as BWF's inability to 'reach down' to both districts and communities, which is also clearly compounded by lack of access to infrastructure and services.

"There is not much communication from the top down – not anything. Money is needed for travel, the radio system is out, many areas have no network and the road system is poor – these are barriers. The only time we get information is when there are workshops, AGMs or annual registrations. I only heard about YWLP at the AGM in 2017." (Regional President South Bougainville, KII, Buka, 22/2/19)

• The evaluation also received feedback from two sources external to BWF that the organisation was not adequately fulfilling its core mandate of working with key political figures and influencing government policy and practice in the interests of Bougainville women. While it is beyond the scope of the evaluation to determine the veracity of these claims, it is significant that they come from respondents with no vested interest in BWF itself, but a strong interest in how well it serves the needs of community members and young women respectively. It also highlights that BWF's mandate includes advocating for access to services in those areas least well served (as outline above) and that it is in BWF's interest to do so.

"BWF is not working well with women Members of Parliament in the sense that these women Constituency Members are not advocating effectively in government for funding and legislation to address women's issues in communities. This includes the issues and interests of young women." (Jeffrey Kop, DFAT, KII, Buka, 22/2/19)

"BWF needs to link and connect with government structures at all levels. The problem is not with the [BWF] structure but those who occupy the roles." (Ward Member North Bougainville, Community Leader, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19)

• There was a suggestion that under the influence of YWLP human rights training, YWAs were more inclusive than BWF as a whole: "As a representative organisation BWF is not too bad. But YWA is more inclusive. We include people living with a disability and young women living in remote areas" (Young women leader, FGD, Buin, 17/2/19).

# RECOMMENDATIONS

- With a view to developing a succession plan for BWF, institute a discussion of the pros, cons and conditions under which more equal representation of young and mature women in national BWF decision making roles might take place.
- Explore ways to improve communication and collaboration at district level between YWAs and DWFs, and between national BWF level and district and community levels, including, for example:
  - Revitalise and strengthen the DWF structure, with the inclusion of a young women leader on the DWF Executive Committee, as well as at Constituency and Ward level. This would ensure young women leaders are mentored and able to represent the concerns of young women at district level, and would assist with transition of young women leaders into the DWF when they turn 30 years of age (the cut-off age for members of YWAs);
    - Review DWF Executive Committee TORs, to ensure they include communication and collaboration with YWAs and more broadly with constituents, e.g. at Constituency and Ward levels; review and improve accountability mechanisms as necessary;
    - Ensure all new DWF members receive an orientation on BWF structure, vision, mission and objectives, membership and program activities, including sustainability strategies such as fundraising;
    - Establish two-way accountability/reporting mechanisms between national and district BWF levels.

- Review existing accountability mechanisms for reporting outcomes of national level advocacy to the membership. Review current mechanisms for linking with government structures at all levels and explore ways to improve communication and collaboration, particularly at Ward level.
- Explore options at national and district levels for being more inclusive of/representing the interests
  of those women who are most vulnerable and marginalised, including single mothers, women living with
  a disability, and women living in remote areas. Develop policies and plans accordingly, e.g. perhaps a
  Gender Equality and Social Inclusion policy.

#### Organisational culture

## ACHIEVEMENTS

There is plenty of evidence that a shift has taken place in BWF organisational culture towards greater acceptance of younger women. A growing number of mature women leaders, many of whom have held leadership roles with BWF for a long time, are supporting young women's leadership potential and recognising their contributions to their communities and to BWF. Many of these mature women are passionate mentors and express a readiness to step back and allow the rising young women leaders to step up and take over (see above in section on mentoring). As a result, young women have taken on leadership roles within the organisation and some now express a new sense of ownership and inclusion as members of BWF.

"Bougainville women are privileged to have an organisation that speaks for them. Young women now have the skills and can start to speak out under the umbrella of BWF." (Young women leader, FGD, Buin, 17/2/19)

Young women are increasingly included in a range of BWF activities such as the AGM (under the new Bill – before parliament at the time of writing – this meeting includes only DWF presidents, Executive Committee members and YWA presidents) and the three-yearly women's Congress (all members). They have also been selected to participate in BWF's Strategic Planning process, have been involved in WAVE program activities to strengthen women's leadership and good governance, and were given priority in selection of participants for trainings, conferences and meetings to which BWF has been invited.

In the realm of administration as well as representation, young women are acceding to prominent roles. The leadership and administrative skills of YWLP graduates, along with their confidence and fresh ideas, have made them desirable employees and many have been recruited to positions with BWF at national level, with young women now comprising a majority of the BWF Secretariat (see above).

# ENABLING FACTORS

- The effectiveness of YWLP in increasing young women leaders' confidence to take on leadership roles in the face of continuing scepticism and opposition from mature some BWF women.
- The quality and relevance of the training delivered by YWLP, which equipped young women leaders with the skills they needed to perform effectively in both leadership and salaried roles.
- A small number of passionate mature women mentors, who not only supported young women leaders but advocated to other mature BWF on their behalf.
- Establishment of YWAs facilitated connection of the Executive Committee to districts for identification and selection of suitable young women for trainings, workshops and conferences, as well as advertising of positions vacant to YWLP graduates in rural areas.

# CHALLENGES/LESSONS LEARNED

While it was widely acknowledged by both young and mature women in BWF that the gap between them
is decreasing and the culture of the organisation is changing, both groups reported they still see room for
improvement when it comes to attitudes. This was also observed by stakeholders outside BWF, including
DFAT's representative on youth affairs in Bougainville.

Persistent negative attitudes of some mature BWF women towards younger women have contributed to the latter's frustration with the pace of change toward a more equitable sharing of power between them. While young women value BWF and their membership in it, they would like to operate within a separate division of the organisation, running their own projects with their own budget. This may not be realistic, but is a potent expression of desire by some very capable young women leaders to take responsibility for ensuring the needs of young women are addressed, based on long term planning and access to secure funding.

# RECOMMENDATIONS

 BWF. Continue to showcase the achievements of young women leaders within BWF, particularly at district level, and foster a closer and more positive "There is only one young woman on the Executive Committee and some EC members feel very uncomfortable about her being there. It's a great threat to some mature women leaders because they realise that their time is 'catching up' and they don't want to give up their positions." (BWF project staff, KII, Buka, 21/2/19)

"I feel the current leaders of BWF mostly don't see that young women can replace them. They are reluctant to give up power and recognition. But you can't call yourself a leader until you have lead someone to replace you. That's your responsibility as a leader." (External stakeholder, KII, Buka, 21/2/19)

district level, and foster a closer and more positive working relationship between DWF and YWAs. **BWF.** In view of the annual funding that BWF is likely to receive in future through statutory provisions of the ABG (i.e. the Bill<sup>4</sup> before parliament at the time of writing), table the issue of separate funding for young women leaders for discussion in the Executive Committee. If approved, this might be in the form of project funding for specific purposes, such as outreach campaigns (in conjunction with DWFs); operational costs for delivery of YWLP training; or kick-start funds for small business development.

#### Organisational strengthening

Activities under the second output under Objective 2 aimed to strengthen BWF capacity to facilitate scale-up

of YWLP and ensure successful delivery of project activities. These were designed to strengthen aspects of the organisation's governance and management capacity.

# BASELINE

The evaluation team was not aware of any baseline data on the organisational and project management capacity of BWF prior to the start of YWLP implementation.

# ACHIEVEMENTS

At the output level, to the extent that YWLP was scaled up and delivered successfully to

"Young women have bright ideas, they have knowledge. Young women have the capacity to address issues, mobilise and increase the awareness of mature women. They should have their own organisation within BWF." (Young women leader, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19)

"There should be two separate organisations. BWF should split any funding it receives between two separate budgets, one for mature women and one for young women – to fulfil their aims and objectives." (Young women leader, FGD, Buin, 17/2/19).

the four target districts and North Bougainville, as evidenced by IWDA donor reports, it can be concluded that this output was achieved.

At the outcome level, results of BWF capacity development that helped facilitate delivery of YWLP included improvement of financial management through quarterly visits from the IWDA Finance Coordinator and recruitment to the role of BWF Finance Officer, a young women leader trained in financial management through the project; a Secretariat and project teams comprising a majority of young women, also skilled and understanding YWLP from the inside.

BWF also received assistance through the WAVE program to develop a strategic plan, "providing us with a roadmap that shows our core business and what we want to achieve in the next three years" (BWF staff member, KII, Buka, 22/2/19). Young women were involved in the strategic planning process to ensure their

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> This Bill will enact BWF as the representative body for women in the ARB. At the time of writing it had passed one sitting of Parliament and was expected to be adopted at the next sitting in 2019.

contribution. However, there is no evidence the strategic planning process had any impact on the project implementation.

# ENABLING FACTORS

Both an achievement of the project and an enabling factor, one of the most significant outcomes for BWF, and instrumental – if not critical – to the delivery of the project activities both to date and into the future, was the development of a cohort of young women trainers with expertise in a range of core topics. According to information sourced from project reports, a total of 20 young women have been trained to deliver the *Gud Disisons, Gud Lidasip* training, financial literacy and FFT trainings. This includes 14 young women from Buin, Kieta, Wakunai, Torokina, Kunua, Selau, Tonsu and Tinputz; and six alumnae from the pilot YWLP phase, based in North Bougainville. Each of the YWAs now have local trainers who can roll out additional trainings in their districts and beyond and if their fundraising plans for 2019 are successful, they will be able to deliver trainings in their communities beyond the life of the project.

CHALLENGE/LESSONS LEARNED AND RECOMMENDATIONS

See below.

# 3.3 EFFICIENCY

# 3.3.1 BWF'S MANAGEMENT OF YWLP; AND 3.3.2: MONITORING

# ACHIEVEMENTS

Notwithstanding that project management is a relatively new area for BWF and was perhaps especially challenging given the organisation was managing multiple projects during the period of YWLP implementation, the organisation succeeded in delivering project activities in all target areas as noted above. The Secretary of ABG's DCD rated BWF's management of YWLP as 'fair' but acknowledged the project's success overall: "as an organisation [BWF] have had some challenges but the project has produced big changes in young women - it's been very good on that" (DCD Secretary, KII, Buka, 21/2/19). It should be remembered, however, that implementation of project activities was achieved largely through the efforts of young women themselves, with the help of YWLP staff but not necessarily BWF the organisation. A cohort of young women trainers delivered core YWLP trainings (with support from project staff, YWAs, and a minority of supportive mature women leaders) and YWAs were instrumental in organising the large project events such as Forums and Caucus meetings, taking livelihood trainings beyond YWLP participants and kick-starting young women's small business initiatives.

# ENABLING FACTORS

- Hands-on involvement at the start of the project by the BWF President at the time, and YWLP staff, in an
  effort to ensure maximum engagement by DWFs, District Administrations and community leaders and
  groups.
- In the absence of strong engagement in YWLP by the majority of DWF leaders, YWAs were an important delivery mechanism for many project activities, including trainings and other events such as the young women's Caucus meetings and Young Women's Forums.
- The development of a cohort of young women trainers to deliver core YWLP training, including *Gud Disisons, Gud Lidasip*, financial literacy and FFT trainings. Many BWF members consulted during the evaluation referred to the cohort of young women trainers as a significant resource that could be instrumental in attracting future funding from a variety of sources.
- Recruitment of dedicated project staff and a minority of supportive mature women leaders.
- Young women's defining characteristics their youth and their gender were identified as an unexpected enabling factor contributing toward the objective of raising BWF's profile and promoting women's leadership: "An advantage for us is that young women attract young men to come and hear what they have to say [about gender equality and/or young women's leadership]" (KII, Buin, 17/2/19).

# CHALLENGES/LESSONS LEARNED

The evaluation found room for significant improvement in BWF's management of the project. Taken together, these weak areas prompted one key informant to question whether a voluntary and representative organisation such as BWF *should* manage projects, and further whether doing so didn't distract from its core representational and advocacy work (KII, Buka, 22/2/19).

Areas identified for improvement in project management were:

- Direction, mentoring and oversight of project staff by BWF Secretariat was identified as lacking by those employed during the initial phases of YWLP. Staff accountability mechanisms, especially for staff based in the regions, was also identified as an area for improvement. For example, two Regional Liaison Officers had been recruited to begin work in July 2016, tasked with facilitating communication and linkages between district centres and the communities from where young women participating in the project would be recruited, but had not been effective in their roles resulting in poor or no implementation of some project activities (BWF staff, KII, 21/2/19).
- BWF's **communication** about the project **with stakeholders** was rated 'poor' by both DCD and DFAT spokespersons, because "results have not been communicated to stakeholders, outside of events such as the Young Women's Forum" (KII, Buka, 21/2/19) which were scheduled YWLP activities.
- It was variously reported that no change of DWF leadership in some DWFs (along with incomplete DWF Executive Committees or dysfunctional leadership) as well as a complete change in DWF leadership (where new leaders had not been briefed on the aims and strategies of YWLP) had also contributed to poor outcomes in some components of the project. This in turn implicates poor oversight of DWFs by BWF.
- **Financial management** was an area in which BWF failed to meet the expectations of its supporting partners and the donor.
- **Monitoring** of project activities and collation and consolidation of project monitoring data in a user friendly form was also an area crying out for improvement:
  - There is no project monitoring information system, not even a simple data base, and no systematic capturing of project outputs as per the MELF. Details of participants who took part in trainings and other events, for example, exist in original paper-based registration forms but have not been collated and consolidated into a user friendly digital form that yields, e.g. total numbers of young women trained in each core topic during the project;
  - Systematic capture of other monitoring data, such as the activities implemented by young women after training, is almost entirely lacking and/or such data is not readily accessible;
     *"There was no monitoring of*"
  - The project's qualitative data is also incomplete, as it focusses on only a small number of individual success stories and does not adequately capture, reflect or learn from the type or extent of changes brought about by YWLP graduates, at output or outcome level;
  - Unexpected changes appear to have been captured in IWDA reports, but there is little evidence of monitoring data being used systematically to inform discussions

"There was no monitoring of young women in rural areas until late in 2018. There was no consultation with or plan for DWFs to monitor them. This should have been an initiative." (BWF staff member, KII, Buka, 21/2/19)

by project staff (with or without young women leaders) and changes/improvements to project strategies or implementation.

 Despite the best efforts of project staff to bring District DCD officers on board early in the project, it was alleged that they "did not collaborate with DWFs and perform their mandated role to assist women and women's groups in the districts" (BWF project staff, KII, Buka, 21/2/19). This meant that skilled YWLP graduates were not (or not immediately) deployed in organisations that would have benefited from their skills and that YWAs missed out on funding available through DCD at district level.

# RECOMMENDATIONS

- Ensure that project staff, Secretariat and Executive Committee members (of implementing partner organisations) are equipped with adequate project management and monitoring, evaluation and learning (MEL) skills by:
  - Providing training in project management and MEL;
  - Conducting an inception workshop to ensure understanding and ownership by all stakeholders of 'big picture' project objectives and details of how all staff/roles contribute to achieving whole;
  - Establishing a project Monitoring Information System, including tools and processes for collecting and analysing project data, in alignment with the project MELF;
  - Establishing accountability and performance appraisal mechanisms which guarantee effective oversight of project management and MEL activities, e.g. by requiring reporting to the Executive Committee.
- Ensure adequate budget for monitoring and evaluation activities.

- Address issues of poor financial management.
- Require YWA Executive Committees to provide quarterly reports to DWF Executive Committees, and DWFs to provide quarterly reports to BWF.
- Conduct annual assessments of YWA activities to improve learnings for young women's programming.

# 3.4 SUSTAINABILITY

The evaluation looked at the sustainability of young women's leadership programming with a focus on the extent to which project outcomes are likely to be sustainable beyond the project's lifetime both at the community and institutional level. It assesses whether YWAs have appropriate support and capacity to continue functioning beyond YWLP, and whether young women leaders have the capacity and resources to continue their leadership at community level.

## ACHIEVEMENTS

#### Young women leaders and YWAs

As noted above, YWLP trained a total of 20 young women leaders as trainers in *Gud Disisons, Gud Lidasip*, FFT, and Games Based Financial Literacy, creating a cohort of trainers with expertise in YWLP core trainings. If YWAs are successful in realising the fundraising plans developed by each association at the 2018 Young Women's Leadership Forum, they will have the funds as well as skills needed to continue rolling out trainings to other young women in their communities in 2019. In terms of economic empowerment, YWAs have capacity and (in theory) resources to sustain their leadership at community level, independently if need be.

Young women leaders have established a reputation for sound financial management and good governance, and at the time of writing, discussions were underway to facilitate further integration of young women leaders into the government's youth association network (Jeffery Kop, DFAT, KII, Buka 22/2/19).

#### BWF

Likewise, at institutional level, the creation of a cohort of young women trainers and the establishment of YWAs ensures sustainability of project outcomes for BWF. The strengthening of organisational capacity through access to skilled trainers and resources (e.g. tailored *Gud Disisons, Gud Lidasip* manual), expanded relationships with training organisations, and structures (i.e. YWAs) through which to attract and organise young women members and deliver trainings, has increased its relevance and viability along with its continued ability to build the capacity of young women leaders.

It was also reported that young women are strengthening BWF by influencing the way decisions are made within the organisation: "now issues are debated, with reference to standards and international frameworks like Human Rights" (YWL, FGD, Buka, 20/2/19). This was felt to improve governance and increase the relevance and attractiveness of the organisation to younger generations.

#### **ENABLING FACTORS**

- Many YWAs are currently active and functioning well. They are receiving support from mature BWF women (including senior leaders), Ward Members, Members of Parliament and community leaders; they receive positive motivating feedback as a result of delivering training and supporting small business initiatives with other young women in their communities; and they have the skills and ability to work well together as teams.
- International donors and partners see YWLP as successful and this presents opportunities for funding going forward. The focus of the BYI, for example, is working with DYAs in Bougainville and the project is now extending into skills-related training so it is a good time for YWLP to integrate (Secretary DCD, KII, Buka, 21/2/19). BYI includes the provision of funding for training that meets the priorities of young people's associations and young women leaders have the ability to provide the training they require.
- **YWLP has increased partnerships and networking** for example, with PLAN international, Nazareth Centre for Rehabilitation, BYI, community leaders, etc. The perception that the project has not been brought in by outsiders has promoted BWF and increased its visibility, while generating local support.

#### CHALLENGES/LESSONS LEARNED

• It appears that IWDA's selection of BWF as the implementing partner of a number of projects in Bougainville, over several years, resulted in an expectation on the part of BWF that this relationship –

and the funding associated with it – would continue. According to an experienced member of the Secretariat, the cessation of YWLP funding had threatened the financial sustainability both of the organisation and Young Women's Leadership programming (KII, Buka, 21/2/19). This would suggest that despite BWF's strong positioning by YWLP to continue young women's leadership programming through non-financial means, for example increased mobilisation of support for YWAs at district level, through DWFs and District DCDs, the requirement to first address the issues of poor coordination of DWFs and their problematic relationship with YWAs (see above) means the organisation is currently unable to follow through on this.

"It's a challenge – the project team has sustainability plans. We'll continue to use young women trainers if there are opportunities and send young women to conferences, where it's a requirement to send a young woman. IWDA's exit puts BWF's financial sustainability at risk. We continue to send out proposals and do fundraising. Maybe we can use YWAs for grant opportunities." (BWF Secretariat member, KII, Buka, 21/2/19)

• Similarly, while in theory YWAs have the capacity to generate funds for continued roll out of training to young women in their communities, in the absence of adequate support and/or leadership, YWAs are

"YWLP is finished now. It's a very good project, the first of its kind. It empowers young women in many ways – leadership, economic empowerment – but it needs to continue until young women are mature as leaders and can step up to occupy important leadership positions." (Young women leader, FGD, Buka, 21/2/19) vulnerable to disintegration. Plans, such as those of one North Bougainville YWA, to establish a self-sustaining resource centre and piggery project for young women with the profits from current income generation projects, in order to create a safe space for training and livelihood projects (IWDA Jul-Dec 2018 Narrative Report, p. 10), will require significant support.

• Young women have expressed concern that without dedicated funding to support the structural changes (i.e. the Young Women's Forums and Caucus) effected in BWF through YWLP, these changes will not be leveraged in support of young women's aspirations to lead at higher and more influential political levels within the organisation, and the outcomes achieved so far will not be sustained.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

- **BWF.** In order to provide ongoing support for Young Women's Leadership programming through BWF at district level, explore ways to improve communication and collaboration at district level between YWAs and DWFs, and between national BWF level and district and community levels (as recommended above).
- Provide funding to BWF to cover the operational costs of the Young Women's Forums and Caucus meetings (and other key activities?) in order to support the structural and cultural transformation of the organisation and the deeper integration of young women into meaningful decision making roles.
- Integrate YWAs with the government structure by registering them with DYAs. Young women's groups at Ward level could also become registered by first affiliating them with YWAs.

# CONCLUSION

The evaluation found that YWLP has been highly successful in achieving outcomes towards strengthening young women's leadership skills and confidence, and increasing their voice in local and regional government affairs. Young women increased their confidence and skills significantly in a range of topics, including financial and business management, and have taken up a range of representative and salaried positions both within BWF and in CSOs and government structures at community, Ward and district levels. Many young women, including some of the most marginalised and vulnerable, have also started small businesses and they (and their families) are benefiting from increased income, self-sufficiency, self-esteem and

"Programs need to be consistently supported. Ideally ABG would allocate funds, but until they are able to do that DFAT will support through programs like BYI. Many young women leaders are trained but not deployed. They can become trainers and train other young leaders coming into the Youth Associations. K100,000 is available to each District Youth Association for institutional strengthening and facilitating affiliation of Ward level youth associations with DYAs – the same structure as BWF." (Jeffrey Kop, DFAT, KII Buka, 22/2/19)

increased respect and support within communities. Albeit unevenly, this has enhanced the enabling environment in target communities for young women's activities outside the home, including leadership activities. YWLP graduates are valued for their positive attitudes, financial management skills, demonstration of good management and integrity, and focus on issues that affect families and communities, such as education and youth unemployment.

YWLP has also been successful in strengthening BWF as a sustainable, inclusive representative body for women across Bougainville. Structural and cultural changes within BWF, including creation of a Young Women's Representative position on the BWF Executive Committee, YWAs and the Young Women's Caucus, along with mature women's increased respect and support for both the abilities and leadership aspirations of younger women, means the organisation is well positioned to shape the next generation of women leaders. BWF has also benefited from increased visibility, relevance and capacity in terms of having a cohort of skilled trainers, resources (e.g. tailored *Gud Disisons, Gud Lidasip* manual), relationships with training organisations, and structures such as YWAs through which to organise young women, attract members, and deliver trainings.

One key unexpected outcome and learning of the program was the significant contribution made by the deepening of a WEE component to the enabling environment for young women's leadership at family and community level. Through acquisition of financial literacy and business management skills, young women have become highly attractive candidates for roles in CSOs and local level government structures; they have started their own business ventures and many have thereby increased their status and power within their families; and they have positioned YWAs to be self-sustaining into the future. However, a question remains as to the focus of YWA activities going forward, particularly in view of the stalled integration of YWAs into the larger existing BWF structures – the DWFs – at District level. How will the YWAs balance their focus (and funds) between support to individual young women's immediate practical needs to generate income and achieve some level of independence, on the one hand, and furthering young women's higher level strategic needs through the collective action within BWF (through the Young Women's Caucus and young women's Executive Committee Representative) on the other? The challenge is to find ways to support young women's collective action at these different levels without losing sight of the higher level objective, namely having a greater voice in local and regional government affairs and policy development. This suggests the need for continued financial support for these nascent structures within BWF.

Complicating the issue of sustainability is the key finding that outcomes were significantly better for YWLP graduates based in urban settings than for young women in rural areas, and that those who needed most support from YWLP received the least. This was due to insufficient project funding for this purpose, insufficient organisational reach and capacity of BWF, and inadequate collaboration between BWF, YWAs and government at District and Ward levels. Within a context of limited funding, this suggests that the priority going forward should be strengthening the reach and capacity of BWF and its communication and collaboration both with YWAs and with government, in order to build the support that is needed for young women leaders in rural, resource-poor settings.

YWLP has a strong focus on capacity building for sustainability and this principle was incorporated into the evaluation itself. In addition to exploring the extent to which project objectives have been met, and identifying key successes, implementation barriers and enabling factors to inform future programming, the evaluation also sought to engage young women participants in a critical reflection on project outcomes (intended and unintended, positive and negative), and to further build capacity of BWF in participatory evaluation techniques. Young women were involved at every stage of the evaluation – the planning, development and finalisation of evaluation questions; development of data collection tools; collection of data in the field; and participation in data analysis workshop and development of recommendations. In addition, mature BWF women had an opportunity to participate in both the planning and data analysis workshops. This has contributed to enhanced understanding of the key enablers and challenges of YWLP and engaged BWF and young women in joint planning on how to sustain the momentum built by the project and move forward together to fuller achievement of project goals. Coming at a time when donor funding for YWLP has come to an end in this cycle, this engagement and ownership will be a crucial enabler in sustaining project outcomes.

# **ANNEXES**

# **ANNEX 1: DOCUMENTS CONSULTED**

- BWF, Young Women in Leadership Program, 2016 Implementation Plan
- BWF, "BREAK THE SILENCE! Hear our Voice! Young Women's Leadership Forum 2018", Press Release
- "Bougainville YWL Youth Grant Proposal Final Revised", 28 May 2015
- BWF-IWDA, Young Women's Leadership Project Summary Financial Report, Jan-Jun 2018
- BWF-IWDA, Young Women's Leadership Project Budget Reforecast, Jan 2016 Jun 2018, SS
- BWF YWLP, Young Women's Leadership Project 2018 Indicators and Targets
- BWF YWLP, Mid Term Review, 12 Jan 2018
- Cowley, A. "IWDA's Pacific Women's Leadership Program (PNG) Bougainville Women's Federation Young Women's Leadership Project: Project Design Document", December 2014
- Cowley, A. "Bougainville Women's Federation: Young Women's Leadership Project Design, IWDA's Pacific Women's Leadership Program (PNG), Report on Project Design Process", December 2014
- Eves, R. & Koredong, I. "Bougainville Young Women's Leadership Research", September 2015
- IWDA, Bougainville YWL Youth Grant Proposal Final Revised: Young Women's Leadership Project, proposed start date: 1 Nov 2015
- IWDA, "Young Women's Leadership Project Budget", submitted to DFAT 27 Mar 2015
- IWDA, Young Women's Leadership Project, Six-Monthly Pacific Women Progress Report: 1 January 2016 30 June 2016
- IWDA, Young Women's Leadership Project, Six-Monthly Pacific Women Progress Report: 1 July 2016 – 31 December 2016
- IWDA, Young Women's Leadership Project, Six-Monthly Pacific Women Progress Report: 1 January 30 June 2017
- IWDA, Young Women's Leadership Project, Six-Monthly Pacific Women Progress Report: 1 July 31 December 2017
- IWDA, Young Women's Leadership Project, Six-Monthly Pacific Women Progress Report: 1 January 30 June 2018
- IWDA, Young Women's Leadership Project, Six-Monthly Pacific Women Progress Report: 1 July 31 December 2018
- IWDA, Young Women's Leadership Project, "Hear Our Voice! Stories of Young Women Leaders in Bougainville, 2016 2018"
- IWDA, Young Women's Leadership Program Quarterly Newsletter, Volume 1, Issue 1, October 2016

Pacific Women Support Unit, "Women in Leadership Synthesis Report: Informing the Pacific Women Shaping Pacific Development Roadmap 2017–2022", March 2017

Pacific Women Shaping Pacific Development, "Factsheet: Young Women in Leadership Project"

# **ANNEX 2: EVALUATION PLAN FINAL**

YOUNG WOMEN'S LEADERSHIP PROJECT: END OF PROJECT EVALUATION: APPROACH, METHODS AND PLAN, FEB 2019

#### **Evaluation Team**

Jane Cousins (Consultant) Melvine Giobun (Evaluation Assistant) Jonitha Lesi (Evaluation Assistant)

#### Overview

The Young Women's Leadership Project (YWLP) is a 30-month, \$1.4 million project implemented by Bougainville Women's Federation (BWF), with support from International Women's Development Agency (IWDA) and funding from Pacific Women Shaping Pacific Development program.

YWLP aims to address the needs and ambitions of young women seeking to increase their leadership effectiveness and provide a safe space in which young women can engage and support each other. It builds on research outlining barriers to young women's leadership and participation in Bougainville and a pilot YWL project which was designed in response to the research findings.

The goals of the project are as follows:

- 1. Young women will have stronger leadership skills and confidence, and a greater voice in local and regional government affairs and policy development.
- 2. The Bougainville Women's Federation (BWF) is strengthened as a sustainable, inclusive representative body for women across Bougainville.

The project targets 120 women across four target districts, delivering trainings on leadership skills, human rights, SRH (and financial management. It also creates safe spaces for young women to organise and be represented within the BWF structure.

#### **Rationale and purpose**

The objectives for this final evaluation are:

- 1. Understand key successes, and explore the extent to which project objectives have been met.
- 2. Highlight implementation barriers and enabling factors to inform future programming.
- 3. Engage young women participants in a critical reflection on project outcomes, (intended and unintended, positive and negative).
- 4. Further build capacity of BWF in participatory evaluation techniques.

# **Evaluation approach**

#### Evaluation questions and scope

The evaluation approach is structured in relation to the following evaluation questions (grouped into three dimensions):

#### Effectiveness

- To what extent has YWLP achieved its objectives and outcome areas? To what extent have project strategies increased young women's leadership through stronger agency and access to leadership opportunities?
  - To what extent have young women's leadership skills and confidence increased as a result of YWLP? To what extent were the most marginalised young women being reached (including those in remote rural areas, those living with a disability and those who are mothers at a young age)?
  - How are young women participating in BWF? At district level? At national level? Does this differ from before the project? If so, how?
  - What factors support young women's participation in BWF? (e.g. mentoring of young women leaders by mature BWF members, support of wider community for young women leaders, support of male advocates, women's economic empowerment)

- What factors still prevent or limit young women's participation in BWF? (HH responsibilities, gender dynamics, age dynamics)
- To what extent do young women have a greater voice in local government affairs?
- What factors support young women's participation in community groups and local government?
- To what extent do young women have a greater voice in regional government and policy development?
- To what extent has young women's participation in BWF increased? At district level? At national level?
- What verifiable impact or significant change (both positive and negative) has the project brought about for young women? Consider whether these changes are attributable to YWLP, and what evidence we have for this?
- Do project participants see BWF as being a more inclusive and representative organisation for young women, including marginalised young women – those in remote rural areas, those living with a disability and those who are mothers at a young age?
- What verifiable impact or significant change (both positive and negative) has the project brought about for BWF at national and district level? Consider whether these changes are attributable to YWLP, and what evidence we have for this?

#### Efficiency

- How efficient is the management of YWLP? Analyse the performance of the Monitoring and Evaluation mechanism of the project and the various tools (database, trackers etc.).
- What is the value of YWLP and BWF's management of YWLP to partners and to beneficiaries?

#### Sustainability:

Are the outcomes likely to be sustainable and enduring? To what extent are the project results likely to be sustainable beyond the project's lifetime (both at the community and institutional level). How could sustainability have been strengthened.

#### **Overall approach**

The Evaluation will assess the project's achievements in relation to the evaluation questions listed above, pertaining to effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability, using the project design and MELF, and the Baseline established by the research conducted jointly by ANU and BWF. The evaluation will use a mixed methods approach as this can capture change in a range of ways, exploring not only what change has occurred, but why and how. Qualitative and quantitative data can complement each other and allow for effective triangulation of data. Qualitative methods such as focus group discussions will enable the views of participants to be heard and will help 'unpack' data from project monitoring and progress reports and add confidence about causality. They will also provide good material for learning and improving the design of future projects.

#### Methods

A desk review of key YWLP documents and materials will include project design documents, work plans, regular monitoring data and progress reports, and two benchmark studies – the research undertaken jointly by ANU and BWF in 2015 to inform design of the YWLP pilot phase, and the baseline survey conducted by BWF at the start of the project. Data at the end-point of the project (both quantitative and qualitative) will be assessed against the research and survey data on the leadership capacities of young women; the level and efficacy of their participation in local in local and regional government affairs and policy development; and the sustainability, inclusiveness and representativeness of BWF as the peak body representing women in Bougainville. Data from project documents will be analysed with reference to these objectives, the 'what' of outcomes achieved, and the 'why' of factors that enabled it or prevented it from happening.

Findings from the desk review will inform the qualitative research by identifying gaps in data, gaps in understanding of how and why project activities were or were not successful, and exploring more fully issues already identified, such as the significant role of young women's economic empowerment as an enabling/success factor.

The data provided by project monitoring, annual reports, along with data from the learning and reflection process captured in the mid term review, will be augmented by, cross-referenced and

triangulated with findings from qualitative data to be collected during the consultant's field trip (see table below). Focus group discussions and other participatory activities such the Spider Web, will be facilitated with groups of young women who have participated in the project in five districts and groups of mature women members of district BWFs. Key informant interviews will be conducted with key YWLP staff, BWF executive members, male and female community leaders, local government representatives, and other stakeholders. For a comprehensive list see below.

After the qualitative data has been collected a reflection workshop will be held with YWLP participants, staff and BWF members, to synthesise and analyse the two data sets and draw conclusions about the outcomes of the project, as well as learning regarding the design, management, and/or implementation that may be useful for future programming.

#### Alignment with ethical research standards

The evaluation will adhere to standard ethical research practices. Prior to participating all in the research activities participants will be fully informed of the purpose and nature of the research and have a chance to ask questions. They will be informed of their right to privacy and confidentiality and the option to withdraw their involvement at any time (see consent forms in Annex 5).

#### **Use of IWDA's Feminist Research Framework**

IWDA's feminist research framework provides guidance for ethical management of evaluation research, with reference to the ACFID Guidelines (2017, p. 3). According to these, while the evaluation research undertaken for the end-line assessment of YWLP required careful oversight and planning it did not require an ethical review<sup>5</sup>. Ethical considerations were managed by the Program Manager, referring to the IWDA Feminist Research Framework.

This was because data was routinely collected, did not address sensitive topics or involve vulnerable groups, and did not use large amounts of participant time. The evaluation activity did not pose any risk for participants beyond those routinely experienced in the environment where the research was conducted, could not be linked to individuals, and the data collected and analysed was only used to identify areas for project improvement.

# KEY RESEARCH QUESTIONS

RESEARCH	SUB-QUESTIONS	METHOD
	I have stronger leadership skills and confid s and policy development.	ence, and a greater voice in local and regional
-	Nomen's Federation (BWF) is strengthened	as a sustainable, inclusive representative body
EFFECTIVENESS	SUB-QUESTIONS	
To what extent have project strategies increased young women's leadership through stronger agency and access to leadership opportunities?	To what extent did target beneficiaries (young women) participate in and benefit from project activities? To what extent do young women see improvements in their leadership capacity and attribute this to participation in YWLP activities? To what extent and in what ways has young women's participation in BWF and other groups increased? At district level? At national level? If so, how and why? With what results? (How are young women participating? At district level? At national level? Does this differ from before the project? If so, how? e.g. increased numbers participating? More confident and effective participation?) What factors support young women's participation in leadership roles, in BWF and other women's groups, community groups and government, business (e.g. mentoring of young women leaders by mature BWF members, support of wider community for young women leaders, support of male advocates, women's economic empowerment) What factors still prevent or limit young women's participation in leadership roles? (HH responsibilities, gender dynamics, age dynamics) To what extent have cultural and social norms and attitudes changed to be more supportive of young women's leadership - within the HH (e.g. in relation to division of domestic labour and decision making) and/or community since the project started? To what extent and in what ways do young women have a greater voice in local and national government affairs? To what extent and in what ways have young women influenced, or are now well positioned to influence, policy development? What/if any unintended negative	<ul> <li><u>Review of project documentation</u>: Baseline and other assessments, achievements against baseline on objective and output performance indicators in reports, etc.</li> <li><u>Focus Group Discussions (FGDs), including with target beneficiaries</u>: <ul> <li>1 x YW leaders in Buin</li> <li>1 x YW leaders in Wakanai</li> <li>1 x YW leaders in Arawa</li> <li>1 x YW leaders in Torokina</li> <li>1 x YW leaders in Torokina</li> <li>1 x YW leaders in Buka</li> </ul> </li> <li>1 x Community leaders (mature BWF, church, CEO, etc.) in Buin</li> <li>1 x CL in Wakanai</li> <li>1 x CL in Arawa</li> <li>1 x CL in Torokina</li> <li>1 x CL in Torokina</li> <li>1 x YP in Arawa</li> <li>1 x YP in Makanai</li> <li>1 x YP in Torokina</li> <li>1 x YP in Buka</li> </ul> <i>Key Informant Interviews with BWF:</i> <ul> <li>BWF President</li> <li>District BWF representative?</li> </ul> <i>Klls with stakeholders:</i> <ul> <li>ARoB government – Minister for Community Dev and Youth/Womens Affairs?</li> <li>District Administrators?</li> <li>UN Women/UNDP in Buka?</li> </ul>

	consequences of the project activities were observed and how were they addressed. Unanticipated positive consequences?	
To what extent has YWLP strengthened the BWF as a sustainable, inclusive representative body for women across Bougainville? What verifiable impact or significant change (both positive and negative) has the project brought about for BWF at national and district level? Are these changes attributable to YWLP, and what evidence do we have for this? What verifiable impact or significant change (both positive and negative) has the project brought about for young women? Are these changes attributable to YWLP, and what evidence do we have for this? What verifiable impact or significant change (both positive and negative) has the project brought about for young women? Are these changes attributable to YWLP, and what evidence do we have for this?	Do project participants see the BWF as being more equitable and inclusive, particularly at district level? To what extent did BWF participate in and benefit from project activities? What has changed for BWF? To what extent did District BWFs participate in and benefit from project activities? To what extent did key stakeholders engage in and benefit from project activities?	<ul> <li><u>Review of project documentation</u>: Baseline and other assessments, achievements against baseline on objective and output performance indicators in reports, etc.</li> <li><u>FGD with BWF Executive</u></li> <li><u>FGD with young women</u></li> <li><u>FGD with community leaders</u></li> <li><u>Key Informant Interviews with BWF:</u></li> <li>&gt; BWF President</li> <li>&gt; DWF Presidents?</li> <li><u>KIIs with stakeholders</u></li> <li>&gt; ARoB government – Minister for Community Dev and Youth/Womens Affairs?</li> <li>&gt; Executive Managers, District Administration</li> <li>&gt; UN Women</li> <li>&gt; DFAT in Buka?</li> </ul>
What verifiable impact or significant change (both positive and negative) has the project brought for young women? Consider whether these changes are attributable to YWLP intervention, and what evidence we have for this?	Do any 'stand out' cases (perhaps among young women leaders families) illustrate this? What positive changes have taken place in gender relations at HH and community level (e.g. support of mature women, men, and other key community stakeholders – chiefs, pastors?). How do these link to increased young women's leadership?	Qualitative data on positive changes       (case studies)         Cross reference with Focus Group       Discussions         - Young women leaders       -         - Mature BWF women leaders and other community leaders       -         - Young non-YWLP participants       Participatory activities with focus groups         Cross reference with baseline and midterm data on young women's access to income generation training; cross reference with target beneficiary FGDs
To what extent were the most marginalised young women reached by YWLP?	How were participants selected? Who are the marginalised young women? Were they consulted in project design? To what extent did marginalised young women (e.g. young mothers, young women living with disabilities, young women living in remote areas) participate in project activities?	<u>KIIs with</u> YWLP staff, BWF District Presidents, CSOs/NGOs (e.g. Callan Services) <u>FGD and participatory activities with young</u> <u>women</u>

	What barriers did marginalised young women face in terms of participation and	
	<ul> <li>how were these addressed YWLP?</li> <li>To what extent has YWLP strengthened the leadership skills and participation (in BWF) of marginalised young women?</li> <li>To what extent is BWF inclusive of marginalised young women leaders/potential leaders? At national and district levels?</li> </ul>	<u>Cross reference with: project monitoring data</u> <u>on young women trained.</u> <u>Cross reference with: project monitoring data</u> <u>on emerging young women leaders,</u> <u>Cross reference with:</u> a focus on increased democratic, participatory and inclusive arrangements in BWF
EFFICIENCY	SUB QUESTIONS	
How efficient was the management of YWLP, including	What was the management structure and was it appropriate to the needs of the project?	Review of project documents – MELF, project database? and component tools.
performance of project M&E?	How was M&E data used by the project? Who were the main users?	KIIs with key YWLP staff: Project Manager, M&E Officer? Finance Officer – cross reference with KIIs with others stakeholders
	Was M&E data used to improve implementation and refine the project strategy? How was the 'feedback' process managed?	FGD with YWLP team
	What do they think of mechanisms for collecting, analysing and sharing information within the project? How do they think these could be improved?	MTR lessons learned
What was the value of YWLP and BWF/IWDA's management of the project to the partners and to beneficiaries?		<ul> <li>KIIs with stakeholders:</li> <li>ARoB</li> <li>DFAT</li> <li>UN Women</li> <li>FGDs with target beneficiaries</li> </ul>
Cost efficiency?	Was the budget adequate to achieve the stated objectives? Was the timeframe for the project realistic? Were resources used efficiently? How could this be improved?	<ul> <li>KIIs with YWLP team members</li> <li>Project financial and narrative reporting</li> <li>KIIs with stakeholders ?:</li> <li>ARoB</li> <li>DFAT</li> <li>UN Women</li> </ul>
SUSTAINABILITY	SUB QUESTIONS	METHOD
Exit strategy	How appropriate is the project exit strategy? If required, how might it be adjusted?	KIIs with YWLP Project Manager FGD with YWLP staff KIIs with stakeholders:
Institutional partners and capacity to leverage resources for scale-up	Has YWLP leveraged resources from other stakeholders to date? If so, how? To what extent did the project leverage the strong interest shown by all stakeholders to position for scale up/replication?	KIIs with YWLP Project Manager KIIs with stakeholders ? ???

# ANNEX 3: FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSIONS AND KEY INFORMANT INTERVIEWS

Location	Young Women Leaders	Community Leaders	Male advocates	Male non- participants	Total FGD participants
Buka	1 x 6 1 x 5	1 x 2	1		14
Arawa	1 x 6	1 x 3		1 x 6	15
Wakunai	1 x 4	1 x 6			10
Buin	1 x 4		1 x 2		6
Total	25	11	3	6	45

# FOCUS GROUP DISCUSSION GROUPS

# **KEY INFORMANTS INTERVIEWS**

Key informant	Position and organisation	Date of interview
Mana Kakarouts	Secretary for ABG Department for Community Development	21/2/19
Geoffrey Kop	DFAT representative, Buka	22/2/19
Rachel Tsien	BWF President	22/2/19
Judith Oliver	BWF Executive Officer	21/2/19
Margarette Kiroha	BWF Program Manager	22/2/19
Bernadette Neras	BWF Regional President, South	19/2/19
Celestine Tommie	BWF Regional President, North	21/2/19
Laura	DWF President, Buin	17/219
Lucy	DWF President, Kieta	19/2/19
Lawrence Chicka	CARE International in PNG	20/2/19
Geraldene Valei	BWF WAVE Project Coordinator	22/2/19

# **EVALUATION WORKSHOP PARTICIPANTS**

Name	Position	Evaluation planning workshop	Evaluation data analysis workshop
Rachel Tsien-	BWF President	Y	Υ
Thecla Hakalits	BWF Treasurer	N	Υ
Henretta Sinei	Young Women's Representative, BWF Executive Committee	Y	Ν
Bernadette Neras	BWF Regional President, South	N	Υ
Judith Oliver	BWF Executive Officer	N	Υ
Margarette Kiroha	BWF Program Manager	Y	Υ
Geraldine Valei	BWF WAVE Project Coordinator	Y	Υ
Celestine Tommie	BWF Regional President, North	Ν	Υ
Florence Tomiets	Young woman alumna/trainer	Y	Υ
Bridgette Mohin	Young woman alumna/trainer, BWF YWLP Project Officer	Y	Y
Jonitha Lesi	Young woman representative	Y	Υ
Melvine Giobun	BWF YWLP Project Coordinator	Y	Y
Louise Anne Peits	NBC Journalist	Υ	N

# ANNEX 4: DATA COLLECTION TOOLS

Young Women's Leadership Project FGD guide – Group 1, Young Women

**Welcome** and thank you for volunteering to take part in this focus group. You have been asked to participate as your point of view is important. I realise you are busy and I appreciate your time.

#### Introduction:

My name is Jane Cousins, and I am an independent consultant. I'm researching the implementation of Young Women's Leadership Project and I'd like to collect your views to improve the way this project works. I'm not BWF staff, and the answers and information you give will be completely confidential. I will describe what people in this community and others think in a report, but I will not mention any names. Your personal contributions and views will not be shared with anyone else in a way that can identify you. Also, you don't have to participate if you don't want to, or, if there are any questions or discussions that you don't want to answer or participate in, you don't have to. However, please try to answer and be as involved as possible. The discussion will take about an hour and a half. Is it OK if I tape the discussion to help me remember it?

**Anonymity and confidentiality:** Although we are taping the discussion it will remain completely anonymous. The tapes will be kept safely in a locked place until they are transcribed word for word, then they will be destroyed. The transcribed notes of the focus group will contain no information that would allow anyone as an individual to be linked to specific statements.

Before we start, I would like to remind you that there are no right or wrong answers in this discussion. I'm interested in knowing what each of you thinks, so please feel free to be honest and to share your point of view, whether you agree or disagree with what you hear. It is very important that I hear all your opinions.

You probably prefer that your comments not be repeated to people outside of this group. Please treat others in the group as you want to be treated by not telling anyone about what you hear in this discussion today.

#### **Ground rules**

- The most important rule is that only one person speaks at a time. You might feel like jumping in when someone is talking but please wait until they have finished.
- There are no right or wrong answers
- You do not have to speak in any particular order
- When you do have something to say, please do. We want to hear from everyone.
- You do not have to agree with the views of other people in the group. As I said, there are no right and wrong answers.
- Does anyone have any questions? (answers).
- OK, let's begin

#### Warm up

• First, I'd like everyone to introduce themselves. Can you tell us your name?

#### Introductory question

I am just going to give you a couple of minutes to think about your experience of participating in the YWLP activities. Is anyone happy to share his or her experience?

#### Questions about young women's leadership

- 1. Was anyone a member of BWF before the project?
- 2. Was anyone a member of another community group before the project?
- 3. Thinking about your experience of being a leader then and being a leader now, has anything changed?
- 4. How do you feel about yourself now as a young woman leader, compared to before the project?
- 5. Can you talk more about what you learned from participating in the project and how you put it into practice in your community?

- 6. Did anything help you to put your new leadership skills into practice? Have you faced barriers or challenges putting in your leadership role during the project? Did you overcome them? How?
- 7. What was your experience of working with a mature BWF mentor?
- 8. Have attitudes to young women leaders changed as a result of the project? How?
- 9. What do you think about BWF as an organisation that represents the concerns and interests of young women in Bougainville?

#### **Concluding question**

• Of all the things we've discussed today, what would you say are the most important issues you would like to express about the YWLP program?

#### Conclusion

- Thank you for participating. This has been a very successful discussion.
- Your opinions are valuable to this study, we hope you have found the discussion interesting too.
- If there is anything you are unhappy with or wish to complain about, please contact the DWF president or speak to me later.
- I would like to remind you that any comments featuring in this report will be anonymous
- Before you leave, please make sure you have completed the attendance list.
- Please remember to maintain confidentiality of the people participating by not disclosing their names.

# Young Women's Leadership Project FGD guide – Group 2, Community Leaders

#### Introductory question

I am just going to give you a couple of minutes to think about your observation of the YWL Project/activities. Is anyone happy to share his or her experience?

#### Questions about young women's leadership

1. How have young women benefited from the project and how are they exercising their leadership roles in the district compared to before their participation in the project?

2. Was there anything that helped young women put their new leadership skills into practice? Did they face barriers or challenges in their leadership role during the project? Did they overcome them? How?

- 3. Have attitudes to young women leaders changed as a result of the project? In what way?
- 4. What would you say is the value of YWLP to the district?

#### **Concluding question**

• Of all the things we've discussed today, what would you say are the most important issues you would like to express about the YWLP program?

# Young Women's Leadership Project FGD guide – Group 3, Male Advocates

#### Introductory question

I am just going to give you a couple of minutes to think about your observation of the YWL Project/activities. Is anyone happy to share his experience?

#### Questions about male advocacy and young women's leadership

- 1. What have you done as a male advocate?
- 2. How do you feel about being a male advocate supporting young women in your community?
- 3. Have you seen any changes as a result of your work as a male advocate?
- 4. Have you had any challenges being a male advocate? Did you overcome them?
- 5. What lessons have you learned from your experience that you think could help male advocates and make this strategy more effective?

#### **Concluding question**

1. Of all the things we've discussed today, what would you say are the most important issues you would like to express about the YWLP program?

#### YWL Project Participatory activities for young women FGD participants

The Spider Web activity will be used to enable a self-assessment by young women in relation to the following dimensions: confidence as leaders, public speaking, planning skills, management and organisational skills, financial literacy, SRH awareness, decision making, community perception of young women leaders.

#### YWL Project FGD Guide – Group 4 young male & female non-YWLP-

#### Introductory question

I am just going to give you a couple of minutes to think about your observation of the YWL Project/activities. Is anyone happy to share his experience?

#### Questions about male advocacy and young women's leadership

- 1. What do know about the project? How did you hear about it?
- 2. Have you had any interaction with a young woman leader or male advocate?
- 3. Have you noticed any changes in the community as a result of the project?
- 4. What do you think about the project?

#### **Concluding question**

1. Of all the things we've discussed today, what would you say are the most important issues you would like to express about the YWLP program?

#### Young Women's Leadership Project - KII District Women's Federation Presidents/Regional BWF Presidents

- 1. How many young women members were there in BWF before the project in this district? How would you describe young women's view of BWF before the project, compared to now?
- 2. How are young women performing their leadership roles in BWF? And how are they participating in other ways in the community?
- 3. Have any changes taken place in age relations within BWF? Please explain.
- 4. What do you think about mature BWF members mentoring young women leaders as a strategy to increase their capacity? Have you observed any challenges for both mature women and younger women? Do you have suggestions for improving the mentoring strategy?
- 5. Is there any effective communication and networking between young women and mature women leaders in the district?
- 6. Have attitudes to young women leaders in BWF changed as a result of the project? How?
- 7. Have attitudes to young women leaders in the community changed as a result of the project? In what way?
- 8. What has changed for BWF, especially DBWFs since the start of the project?

# Young Women's Leadership Project - KII DFAT Youth Program Representative

- 1. What is the value of YWLP to DFAT and beneficiaries?
- 2. What are the major learnings from YWLP Project to approaches on strengthening young women's leadership skills and confidence, and increasing their voice in local and regional government affairs and policy development?
- 3. How do you rate technical approaches adopted by YWLP?
- 4. How do you rate BWF's efforts to represent young women's interests at national level?
- 5. Do any of the successful interventions of YWLP project have wider implications for women's leadership in Bougainville and in particular young women's leadership?
- 6. How do you rate the performance of YWLP and BWF's management of YWLP?
- 7. Is there any regular interaction and exchange of information between DFAT and BWF/IWDA?
- 8. To what extent did YWL Project link up with other projects/organisations and add value to each other's efforts?

# **ANNEX 5: CONSENT FORMS**

#### Individual Consent Form – Key Informant Interview

Thank you for volunteering to take part in this interview. You have been asked to participate as your point of view is important. I realise you are busy and I appreciate your time.

My name is Jane Cousins, and I am an independent consultant working with young women research assistants Melvine Gionun and Jonitha Lesi. We're researching the implementation of Young Women's Leadership Project and would like to collect your views to understand what this project has achieved and how it can be improved. I'm not BWF staff, and the answers and information you give will be completely confidential. We will describe what people in this community and others think in a report, but I will not mention any name. Your personal contribution and views will not be shared with anyone else in a way that can identify you. Also, if there are any questions or discussions that you don't want to answer or participate in, you don't have to. However, please try to answer and be as involved as possible. The interview will take about an hour. Is it OK if we tape the discussion to help us remember it?

If you have any concerns or complaints about how this research has been conducted, please contact:

I have had a conversation with the researcher about this study and have read the above information. My questions have been answered to my satisfaction. I consent to participate in the study.

	YES	NO
I hereby give my consent for audio recording		
I would like an alias used in any publication (please do not use my real		
name)		
I understand that I can withdraw from this study at any time (including withdrawing the use of certain information), with no consequences		
I would like research findings and other documents relating to this research sent to me at the address I provide below (email or postal)		

Declaration by Research Participant: I have chosen to participate in this research with full consent:

SIGNED \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_ DATE \_\_\_\_\_ / \_\_\_\_\_ /\_\_\_\_\_

[If the consent of a guardian is requested, then a field for their consent should be created]

Declaration by Researcher: I have given a verbal explanation of the study, its procedures and risks and I believe that the participant has understood that explanation.

Researchers Name:	SIGNED	DATE / /

#### Group Consent Form – YWLP Evaluation

Consent to Participate

I acknowledge that I am at least eighteen years old, and that I understand my rights as a research participant as outlined above. I acknowledge that my participation is fully voluntary.

Location:	Date:
Print name	Signature

#### Consent Form for Photos and Videos – YWLP Evaluation Feb 2019

Consent to my photo and / or a video in which I appear being used in the YWLP Evaluation Report

I acknowledge that I am at least eighteen years old, and that I understand my photo or video in which I appear will be used only in YWLP. I acknowledge that my agreement is fully voluntary.

Location:	Date:
-----------	-------

	Signature	Photo		Video	
Print name		Yes	No	Yes	No

# ANNEX 6: YWLP DATA ANALYSIS WORKSHOP SCHEDULE

Due to late arrival of participants at 10.30, the first activity was eliminated from the schedule. Day 1 activities ran into Day 2. Day 2 activities focussed on developing recommendations for both Objectives, in three groups, two of BWF mature women and one of YWLs.

DAY 1			
Time	Activity	Method	Materials
9.00 – 9.30	Warm up participatory activity – Spider web for BWF	As a whole group – young and mature women together – they will complete a before and after spider web on progress on a range of dimensions indicative of progress toward achieving Objective 2	Flipchart paper with pre-drawn spider web
9.30 – 10.00	<b>Review of YWLP project</b> - objectives, key outputs and indicators. Overview of the emerging findings from consolidated report, monitoring and evaluation research data	PowerPoint presentation and/or project Logframe on wall	Projector, screen Flipchart paper
10.00 – 10.30	30         What has been achieved?         Group work - data will be printed in 14pt         I           Group work to consolidate data         paragraphs and categorised roughly under         I		Flipchart paper, large format printout of data
10.30 – 11.00	Morning tea		
11.00 – 12.00	What has been achieved?	<b>Group work</b> – Groups will continue, then swap objectives. When finished, groups will present in plenary and discuss if necessary to reach consensus.	Flipchart paper, large format printout of data
12.30 – 1.30	Lunch		
1.00 – 2.30	What have we learnt? Develop answers to 'why' questions. What factors have contributed to progress, challenges and unexpected results? Were challenges overcome and if so how?	on Objective 2, listing enablers and	Flipchart paper, large format printout of data
2.30-3.00	Afternoon tea		
3.00 – 4.00	What have we learnt? continued	<b>Group work -</b> continued <b>Plenary session –</b> learnings presented in plenary and discussed.	Flipchart paper
4.00 -4.30	Summary of the day and close	Consultant	
DAY 2			
Time	Activity	Method	Materials
9.30-3.00	Developing recommendations to address challenges identified	<b>Group work and plenary</b> - In 3 groups (2 of mature and 1 of young women) - work to develop recommendations for BWF on Objective 1. Share, discuss and refine in plenary. Same with Objective 2.	Flipchart paper, white board
3.00 – 4.00	Recap of key findings, learnings and recommendations	<b>Plenary session</b> – consultant recaps learnings and recommendations.	Projector and White board

Level 1, 250 Queen Street Melbourne VIC 3000

1300 661 812 iwda@iwda.org.au www.iwda.org.au

ABN 19 242 959 685 ACN 126 216 165

